

A Series of Ideological Researches

# **A Critical Assessment of Umm Kulthum's Marriage to Umar**

Ayatollah al-Sayyid ‘Alī al-Ḥusaynī al-Mīlānī

Translated by: Jawid Akbari

Islamic Truths Center

**Title:** A Critical Assessment of Umm Kulthum's Marriage to Umar

**Author:** Ayatollah al-Sayyid 'Alī al-Husaynī al-Mīlānī

**Translator:** Jawid Akbari

**Publisher:** Islamic Truths Center

**Cover Design & page-setting by:** M. A. Fayyazi

**Year of Publication:** 1442 /1400 AH /2021 CE

**Print-run:** 200



**Distribution centers:**

No. 30, Alley 38, Safaeyya Street, Qom, Iran

Tel: +98-2537741812

Basement Floor, Publisher's Complex, Qom, Iran

Tel: +98-2537837320

-----  
[www.alhaqaeq.org](http://www.alhaqaeq.org) Email: [info@alhaqaeq.org](mailto:info@alhaqaeq.org) SMS: 10001414

All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of Islamic Truths Center.



**In the Name of God, the Compassionate, the Merciful**



## Contents

Preface .....	1
Introduction .....	4

### Part I

#### The Narrations and Their Narrators

The Narrators and Their Narrations.....	9
1. Ibn Sa'd's Narrations in al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra .....	9
2. al-Dūlābī's Narrations in <i>al-Dhurriyat al-Tahira</i> .....	13
3. Hākim al-Nīshābūrī's Narration in al-Mustadrak.....	19
4. Al-Bayhaqī's Narrations in al-Sunan al-Kubra .....	20
5. Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī's Narrations in <i>Tārīkh Baghdad</i> .....	22
6. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's Narrations in <i>al-Isti'āb</i> : .....	23
7. Ibn Athīr's Narrations in <i>Usd al-Ghabah</i> .....	26
8. Ibn Ḥajar's Narrations in <i>al-Iṣābah</i> .....	29

### Part II

#### A Study of the Chains of Transmission of the Narrations

A Study of the Chains of Transmission of the Narrations.....	34
The Focal Point in this Regard .....	35
Aḥmad b. 'Abdul Jabbār as Seen by Biographers .....	39
Yūnus b. Bukayr as Seen by Biographers .....	39
'Amr b. Dīnār as Seen by Biographers .....	40
Sufyān b. 'Uyayna as Seen by Biographers .....	42
Wakī' b. al-Jarrāḥ as Seen by Biographers .....	43
Ibn Jurayj as Seen by Biographers .....	44
Ibn Abī Malīka as Seen by Biographers.....	46
Hushām b. Sa'd as Seen by Biographers.....	46
Ibn Wahab as Seen by Biographers .....	47
Mūsa b. Ali al-Lakhmī as Seen by Biographers.....	48
Ali b. Rabāh al-Lakhmī as Seen by Biographers .....	49
'Uqba b. Āmir al-Juhanī as Seen by Biographers .....	50
'Atā al-Khurāsānī as Seen by Biographers.....	51

## Contents

b

Muḥammad b. ‘Umar al-Wāqīdī as Seen by Biographers .....	52
‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Zayd as Seen by Biographers.....	53
Zayd b. Aslam as Seen by Biographers .....	54
Zubayr b. Bakkār as Seen by Biographers.....	55
A Study of the Chains of Transmission of Narrations.....	56
Authenticity of Narrations about Umm Kulthūm’s Death.....	56
A Look at the Biography of ‘Āmīr al-Sha‘bī.....	57
A Look at the Biography of ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār .....	58
A Look at the Biography of Nāfī‘ .....	58
A Look at the Biography of ‘Abdullah al-Bahī .....	59

### Part III

#### The Text of the Narrations and Their Significations

The Text of the Narrations and their Significations .....	61
First dimension: .....	61
Second dimension: .....	66
Third dimension: .....	67
Fourth dimension:.....	68
Fifth dimension: .....	70
Sixth dimension: .....	71
Seventh dimension: .....	72
Eighth dimension:.....	73
Ninth dimension: .....	74
Tenth dimension: .....	76
Summary .....	78
One Question.....	81
Answer .....	82

### Part IV

#### ‘Umar’s Marriage to Umm Kulthūm in Shiite Narrations

‘Umar’s Marriage to Umm Kulthūm in Shiite Narrations .....	86
The first tradition: .....	87
The second tradition: .....	87
The third tradition:.....	88
Final Word Concerning the Marriage of Umm Kulthūm .....	90
Summary of the Book.....	92
Bibliography .....	94

## **Preface**

With the prophetic mission of Prophet Muḥammad (s), the seal of the prophets, the last and the most perfect divine religion was conveyed to humanity and prophethood came to an end. The religion of Islam emerged in Mecca but after twenty three years of arduous efforts made by the Messenger of Allah (s) and a handful of his loyal companions it spread all over the Arabian Peninsula.

The continuation of this divine mission was an important undertaking that was entrusted publicly on Dhul Ḥijja, the eighteenth, by Allah, to Ali (a), the Commander of the Faithful and the first noble figure after the Holy Prophet (s) in the Islamic world.

With the proclamation of Hazrat Ali's guardianship and succession on this day, divine blessings were completed and the religion of Islam was perfected and announced as the only religion chosen by Allah. That was how unbelievers and pagans despaired of destroying Islam.

Soon after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (s), some of the companions of the Holy Prophet (s), based on their pre-hatched conspiracies, deviated from the course of guidance and leadership. They closed the gate of the city of knowledge putting Muslims in perplexity. From the very beginning of their rule, they placed the truths of Islam – that were like shining sun – behind the dark clouds of doubt and skepticism by way of putting a ban on recording prophetic

narrations, spreading fabricated narrations, casting doubts and embarking on hypocritical and deceptive tactics.

Obviously, in spite of all conspiracies hatched by the enemies of Islam, the truths of Islam and noble sayings of the Messenger of Allah (s) were promulgated by the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a), his successors and a few of his devout companions and those truths continued to flow and manifest themselves in one way or the other in the course of history. By explaining the truths, they dispelled the doubts, specious arguments, and wrong beliefs inculcated by the enemies of Islam, and made the truth clear to all.

In this respect, great scholars and men of knowledge such as Shaykh al-Mufid, Sayyid Murtadha, Khaja Nasir, Allama Hilli, Qadhi Nurullah, Mir Hamid al-Husayn, Sayyid Sharafuddin, Allama Amini etc. having been glittering like shining stars, since they are the ones who defended Islamic truths, explained the realities of the school of Ahl al-Bayt (a) and dealt with spurious arguments using their tongues and pens.

In our era, one of the outstanding scholars and researchers who has, with his eloquent pen and expressive writing, explained the truths of the religion of Islam and astutely defended the *imamate* and *wilāyah* (guardianship) of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) is Ayatollah al-Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani, a great researcher.

The Islamic Truths Center is proud to take up the task of reviving the fruitful and precious works of that great researcher by reviewing, translating and publishing them in a bid to make them available to students, scientific figures and those who are in search of Islamic truths.

The book in your hand is a translation of one of his works which will now acquaint the English readers with Islamic truths. It is expected that this humble effort will earn the



pleasure of Baqiyyatullah, the Imam of Age, may Allah hasten his reappearance.

Islamic Truths Center

## Introduction

The purpose of writing this book is to conduct a research into the narrations or reports regarding 'Umar's marriage to Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him. This event has always been used by a group of people to deny the bitter incidents and adverse events that took place during the early period of Islam in regards to Ali b. Abī Ṭālib and Fāṭima Zahrā, peace be upon them. Thus, they argue as such:

If what is known as 'Umar's assault on Ali's house were correct and his attack led to the martyrdom of Fāṭima, the daughter of Holy Prophet (s), such a marriage or matrimony would not have taken place but it took place and we conclude, therefore, that the alleged events are not true and that Ali (a) and 'Umar were in quite good terms with each other.

This study delves into the narrations regarding 'Umar's marriage to Umm Kulthūm in a bid to clarify whether the foregoing argument is complete and reasonable or invalid and fruitless.

Obviously, such an argument can be complete and acceptable only when:

1. The subject around which we discuss should have existed. That is to say, it must be proved, in the first place, that the Commander of Faithful, Ali (a) had a daughter by the name Umm Kulthūm. Therefore, if a daughter by this name never existed, or Fāṭima Zahrā (a) did not have such

- a daughter – as stated by some scholars, the above argument would be incomplete and out of place.
2. It could be termed as marriage between ‘Umar and Umm Kulthūm by simply pronouncing the formula of marriage contract. If conclusion of marriage contract between those two depends on conjugal relations, this argument will again be incomplete and you will see that there is no concrete evidence to show that the two sides had conjugal relations.
  3. Assuming that such a marriage took place, the argument would be justified only when the marriage should have taken place with complete consent and approbation. In case, the marriage, as stated by the narrations of the Two Sects, has taken place under coercion, intimidation and pressure, making recourse to such an argument would then be counterproductive and it will be counted as another injustice done to the Prophet’s progeny (a).

Al-Sayyid ‘Alī al-Ḥusaynī al-Mīlānī

**A Critical Assessment of  
Umm Kulthūm's Marriage to 'Umar**

### **In the name of Allah, the Compassionate the Merciful**

All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds. May the peace and blessings of Allah be upon our Master, Muḥammad, and his pure family, and may the curse of Allah be upon all of their enemies.

Since the early Islamic centuries as of now, a lot of inquiries and investigations have been conducted and answers given concerning the following narration: “*The Commander of Faithful, Ali (a) married his daughter to ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb*”.

Also, books, treatises and articles have been written in this regard. For instance, Shaykh al-Mufīd, may Allah be pleased with him, has authored two well-researched treatises in this regard, of which one has been presented in the book titled *Ajwibat al-Masa’il al-Sarawiyya* in reply to the tenth question and the other has been presented in *Ajwibat al-Masa’il al-Hājibiyya* in reply to the fifteenth question.

The present book is the result of research concerning this incident. In this study, first of all, the original narration has been cited from the most famous Sunni books whereupon their chains of transmission as well as their significations and import have been examined and criticized.

This study aims to examine the story, unveil and clarify the truth and finally put a stop to controversies and disputes in this regard.

And Allah is Felicitous and He is the Helper.

# 1

## The Narrations and Their Narrators

## The Narrators and Their Narrations

One of the well-known narrations found in Sunni sources is the narration based on which they argue that “the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) married out his daughter, Umm Kulthūm, to ‘Umar”. They have transmitted this narration in their most famous sources which will be quoted later:

### 1. Ibn Sa’d’s Narrations in *al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*

As far as we know, the earliest narrator who has passed on this tradition is Muḥammad b. Sa’d b. Manī‘ Zuhri (d. 230 A.H), the author of *al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*. He has narrated several narrations in his book on this subject which are as follows:

**First narration:** Umm Kulthūm was the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib b. ‘Abdul Muṭṭalib b. Hashim b. ‘Abd Manaf b. Qusay. Her mother was Fāṭima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s) and Khadijah bint Khuwaylid b. Asad b. ‘Abdul ‘Uzza b. Qusay. She was a young girl when ‘Umar married her. The fruit of this marriage was a son called Zayd and a daughter called Ruqayya. Umm Kulthūm remained ‘Umar’s wife until he was killed.

After ‘Umar, ‘Awn b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib b. ‘Abdul Muṭṭalib married her (!)<sup>1</sup>, but ‘Awn too died and thereupon, ‘Awn’s brother, Muḥammad b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib became her husband. He too passed away.

Then his brother, ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib married Umm Kulthūm after the death of her sister, Zaynab, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib (a). Umm Kulthūm points to it saying: “I feel ashamed of Asma bint ‘Umays whose two sons died when they were in my company, and I am worried about the third one!” Umm Kulthūm died in ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far’s house and did not bear a child with anyone of them!

**Second narration:** ‘Umar b. al-al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for the hand of Umm Kulthūm in marriage. Ali said: “I have kept my daughters for Ja‘far’s sons .”

‘Umar said: “Marry her to me, O Abū al-Ḥasan, for by Allah, there is no man on the face of the earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.”

Ali said: “I have done so.”

Then ‘Umar came to the Muhajirun (lit. migrants) between the grave (of the Messenger of Allah) and the pulpit. They — Ali, ‘Uthmān, Zubayr, Ṭalha and Abdur Raḥmān — used to sit there, and whenever news about new developments arrived from the frontiers, ‘Umar would come to there and consult with them. He came to them and said: “Congratulate me”.

They congratulated him, and asked: “With whom are we congratulating you, O Amīrul Mu’menin?”

---

<sup>1</sup> We have used a sign of exclamation (!) in our translation of some of the bizarre, problematic and objectionable passages taken from their sources.



He replied: “With the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib.”<sup>1</sup>

Then he told them the story and said that he had heard the Prophet (s) say:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَنَسَبٍ مَنْقُوعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبِيَّ وَنَسَبِي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*<sup>2</sup>

I was a companion of the Prophet and I also loved this – relationship – to continue.

**Third narration:** “Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ narrates from Hushām b. Sa‘d, he from ‘Atā’ al-Khurāsānī that he said: “‘Umar paid forty thousand [dirham] as dowry [mahr] to Umm Kulthūm!”

**Fourth narration:** Muḥammad b. ‘Umar al-Wāqidī and others have said that ‘Umar asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kulthūm, in marriage. Ali replied that she had not yet attained the age (of puberty).

‘Umar replied: “By Allah, this is not true. You do not want her to marry me. I know what you mean.”

Thus, Ali called Umm Kulthūm, they prepared her and made her up. Then he asked for a piece of cloth which he folded and handed over to Umm Kulthūm telling her to take the garment to Amīrul Mu’menin and tell him: “My father has sent me to you instructing me to convey you his greetings and said that if you liked the garment, take it or else, return it!”

When Umm Kulthūm went to ‘Umar, the latter said: “May Allah bless you and your father, I like it.”

---

<sup>1</sup> Ibn Sa‘ad, *al-Tabaqat al-Kubra* vol.8 p.338 (ed. Dar al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, Beirut 1990)

<sup>2</sup> Some translators have translated this tradition as such: “On the Judgment Day every means will be cut off and every lineage severed except my lineage.”

Umm Kulthūm returned to his father and said: “He did not unfold the garment, but just looked at me!”

Then Ali married her to ‘Umar and she bore him a child named Zayd.

**Fifth narration:** Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ narrates from Isma‘il b. Abī Khālid, he from ‘Āmir Sha‘bi that both Zayd b. ‘Umar and Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali, died. Ibn ‘Umar offered funeral prayer consisting of four takbīrs (Allahu Akbar). He placed Zayd on the side he himself had stood and Umm Kulthūm in the direction of Qibla and prayed on their dead bodies.

**Sixth narration:** Ubaydullah b. Mūsa says: “Isra’īl narrates from Abī Ḥaṣin, he from ‘Āmir who said: “Ibn ‘Umar offered a funeral prayer on Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali, and her son. He placed Zayd on his side and prayed on those two.”

Wakī‘ has reported a similar account from Zayd b. Ḥabīb, from Sha‘bi and added: “During the (funeral) prayer, al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn, the sons of Ali, Muḥammad b. Hanafiyya, ‘Abdullah b. ‘Abbās and ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far stood praying behind Ibn ‘Umar.”

**Seventh narration:** ‘Ubaydullah b. Mūsa and Isra’īl have narrated from Jābir, he from ‘Āmir Sha‘bi that he said: “During the prayer on the corpse of Zayd b. ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar led the prayer while al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn prayed behind him. Had he considered it appropriate to say more ‘takbir’ (Allahu Akbar), he would have said it.”

**Eighth narration:** ‘Ubaydullah b. Mūsa narrates from Isra’īl, from Suddi, from ‘Abdullah b. Bahā that he said: “I saw Ibn ‘Umar pray on Umm Kulthūm and Zayd b. ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb and that he placed Zayd on the side where the

Imam (the prayer leader) was standing while al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn were witnessing the prayer.”

**Ninth narration:** Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ narrates from Hammad b. Salama, that ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār (Mawla<sup>1</sup> of Bani Hashim) said: “I was present on the day on which Sa‘īd b. ‘Āas, who was then the governor of Medina, prayed on those two with eighty people from the companions of Prophet Muḥammad (s) following him during prayers.”

**Tenth narration:** Ja‘far b. ‘Awn narrates from b. Jurayh that Nāfi‘ said: “The bodies of Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib and wife of ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb and her son Zayd were brought in for funeral prayer. On that day Sa‘īd b. ‘Āas was the prayer leader.”

**Eleventh narration:** ‘Abdullah b. Numayr narrates from Isma‘īl, he from Ibn Abī Khālid who narrates from ‘Āmir that: “Ibn ‘Umar offered prayers on the dead bodies of his brother Zayd and Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali. The corpses of those two were in one casket and Zayd’s body was on the side close to the prayer leader.”<sup>2</sup>

## 2. al-Dūlābī’s Narrations in *al-Dhurriyat al-Tahira*

Another scholar who has reported and recorded narrations in this regard is Abū Bushr Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-al-Dūlābī (d. 310 A.H). In his *al-Dhurriyat al-Tahira*, he has reported several narrations regarding Umm Kulthūm bint Fāṭima, daughter of the Holy Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.

**First narration:** al-Dūlābī says: “I heard Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār saying: I heard Yūnus b. Bukayr say that he had heard from Ibn Ishāq that Fāṭima, the daughter of the Holy Prophet (s), gave birth to three sons named al-Ḥasan, al-Ḥusayn and

---

<sup>1</sup> A freed slave is known as ‘Mawla’

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*, 8/338 – 340.

Muhsin. The latter died at a young age. She also gave birth to two daughters named Umm Kulthūm and Zaynab.”

**Second narration:** Ibn Ishāq says: “‘Āsim b. ‘Umar b. Qatada narrated to me as such: “‘Umar asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kulthūm in marriage to himself and Ali replied that she had not yet attained the age (of puberty).

‘Umar replied: “By Allah, this is not true...<sup>1</sup> You do not want her to marry me. If she is underage, send her to me.”

Thus, Ali gave his daughter Umm Kulthūm a piece of cloth and asked her to go to ‘Umar and tell him that her father wanted to know if he liked the cloth. When she came to ‘Umar and gave him the message, he grabbed her hand and forcibly pulled her towards himself. Umm Kulthūm asked him to leave her hand, which ‘Umar did and said: “How good looking and delicate!<sup>2</sup> Go and tell your father that you are very pretty and you are not what he said of you!”

With that Ali married Umm Kulthūm to ‘Umar.

**Third narration:** Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār narrates from Yūnus b. Bukayr, from Khālīd b. Sālīh, from Waqīd b. ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar, from some of his relatives that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kalthum bint Fāṭima (daughter of the Holy Prophet (s)) in marriage.

Ali said to him: “She has other guardians also, wait until I get their permission.” Then Ali (a) went to Fāṭima’s sons and

<sup>1</sup> In the printed copy of the book, the following has been recorded: “There is a word here which is not readable”! But the original sentence is this: “No, I swear by Allah! That is not true.”

<sup>2</sup> In the printed copy of the book, it has been written as such: “There is a word here which is not readable”! But in the tradition of Muḥib al-Dīn al-Ṭabarī, there is not any word.”

informed them about 'Umar's proposal whereupon they said: "Marry her to him."

Ali called Umm Kulthūm, who was then a young girl then, and said to her: "Go to the Commander of the Faithful, and tell him: "My father sends you his greetings and says that he has fulfilled your wish."

Upon reaching 'Umar's house, Umm Kulthūm conveyed him her father's message whereupon 'Umar grabbed her and held her to his bosom (!! ) and said: "I sought Umm Kulthūm's hand in marriage and her father married her to me."

They said to 'Umar: "What do you mean, O Commander of the Faithful? She is a young girl?!"

'Umar said: "Do not disparage me [for marrying a young girl], for I heard the Prophet say, upon him be blessings and peace:

«كل سبب و نسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي و نسبي»

*'Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and lineage.'*

I desired to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage."

**Fourth narration:** Abdur Raḥmān b. Khālīd b. Manī' says: "Habib, Mālik b. Anas's scribe, narrates from 'Abdul 'Azīz Darawirdi, from Zayd b. Aslam, from his father, who was the freed slave of 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, saying: "'Umar asked Ali for Umm Kulthūm's hand in marriage whereupon Ali discussed the matter with 'Abbās, 'Aqīl and al-Ḥasan. 'Aqīl was annoyed telling Ali: "The lapse of days and months will only add to your lack of insight and astuteness in your matter. By Allah, if you do this, such and such will happen."

Ali told ‘Abbās: “By Allah, he is not talking wishfully, but the whip of ‘Umar has impelled him to do what you are seeing.”<sup>1</sup>

Then Ali turned to ‘Aqīl and said: “O ‘Aqīl, I swear by Allah that it is not because of my inclination to you and your opinion, but ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb informed me that he heard the Messenger of Allah (s) say:

«كل سبب و نسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي و نسبي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*

**Fifth narration:** ‘Abdul ‘Azīz b. Manī‘ has narrated from Abū al-Darda’ Marwazi, from Khālid b. Khidāsh; also, Ishāq b. Ibrahim b. Muḥammad b. Sulaymān b. Bilal b. Abī al-Darda’ al-Anṣārī has reported from Abū Jamahir Muḥammad b. ‘Uthmān who said: “‘Abdullah b. Zayd b. Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather, narrated that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, with a dowry of 40,000 dirham”!

**Sixth narration:** Abū Osama ‘Abdullah b. Muḥammad, from Al-Ḥajjāj b. Abī Manī‘, from his grandfather, from Zuhri who narrates: “‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb married Umm

<sup>1</sup> It is inferred from the reliable traditions and the above statements that Imam Ali (a) was against this marriage and because of the threats from ‘Umar, ‘Aqīl wanted this marriage to take place and his anger was also because of the same threat.

Therefore, Imam Ali (a) did not declare his acceptance to this marriage to be out of good will.

Of course the surprising part is in the rest of the above narration, where we are seeing that the opinion of Amīrul Mu’minīn Ali (a) changed at once and that too was not because of the threats from Umar, but because of Umar's keenness to form a relationship with the Messenger of Allah (s) (!!).

Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali and his wife Fāṭima and they were blessed with a baby boy named Zayd.”

**Seventh narration:** Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār narrates from Yūnus b. Bukayr who narrated from Ibn Ishāq who reported that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali and they were blessed with a baby boy named Zayd and a daughter. ‘Umar died while he was alive.

**Eighth narration:** Abū Osamah ‘Abdullah b. Muḥammad Halabi, from Al-Ḥajjāj b. Abī Manī‘, from his father, from Zuhri who narrates: “After ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, ‘Awn b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib married Umm Kulthūm (!) and she did not bear a child from ‘Awn, until the he died.”

**Ninth narration:** Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār narrates from Yūnus b. Bukayr who narrates from Ishāq, who narrates: “When ‘Umar, the husband of Umm Kulthūm bint Ali, died, ‘Awn b. Ja‘far married Umm Kulthūm and he also died in her lifetime without her bearing a child with him.”

**Tenth narration:** Ibn Ishāq says: “My father Ishāq b. Yasar narrates from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan b. Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, who said: “When Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib was widowed of ‘Umar, her brothers al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn went to her and said: “You are known as the first lady of Islam and the daughter of the best lady of the world. We swear by Allah that if you leave your decision to Ali, he will definitely marry you to one of his orphans (!) and if you wish to get much wealth, you will definitely get it.”

I swear by Allah, no sooner they got up than Ali arrived while he was leaning on his walking stick. Praising and thanking Allah, he reminded them of their status and dignity to the Prophet of Allah (s) and said: “O the children of Fāṭima, you are aware of your status and dignity and you know well that I have given you priority over my other

children owing to your position and relationship to the Messenger of Allah (s).”

They said: “You are right, may Allah bless you and may He reward you on our behalf.”

Ali turned to his daughter and said: “My daughter, Allah has granted you the power to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you leave that to me.”

Umm Kulthūm said: “Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations and desires of all other women, I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women do; I wish to decide for myself what I should do in this regard.”

Ali said: “My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your opinion; it is that of these two!”

Then he stood up and said: “You will either do this or you will never talk to any of these two!”

Al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn grabbed their father’s dress and said: “Dear father, sit down. By Allah, we cannot bear to miss you.” Then they told Umm Kulthūm: “Leave the decision of your marriage to him.”

Umm Kulthūm said: “I have done so.”

Ali said: “I will marry you to ‘Awn b. Ja‘far, who is an adolescent.”

Thereupon, Ali returned to Umm Kulthūm taking her four thousand dirham. Then he informed his nephew and sent her to him.

Al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan says: “By Allah, ever since the beginning of creation as of now, I know of no love to be like her love of ‘Awn.”

**Eleventh narration:** Abū Ishāq, Ibrahim b. Ya‘qūb b. Ishāq Jawzjani narrates from Yazid b. Harūn, from Hammad b.



Salamah, from ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār that he said: “Both Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali, and Zayd, the son of ‘Umar died. We shrouded those two and Sa‘īd b. ‘Āas offered funeral prayer on them with al-Ḥasan, al-Ḥusayn and Abū Hurayra praying behind him.”

**The twelfth narration:** Ibrahim b. Ya‘qūb narrates from Yazid b. Hārūn, he from Ismā‘īl b. Abī Khālīd that he said: “‘Āmir was asked as to how the prayer on the corpses of men and women were offered to which he replied: “When I arrived, I saw ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar offering funeral prayer on his brother and his mother Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib.”<sup>1</sup>

### 3. Hākim al-Nīshābūrī's Narration in al-Mustadrak.

Hākim, Abū ‘Abdullah al-Nīshābūrī (d. 405 A.H.), has narrated only one tradition in this regard as follows:

al-Ḥasan b. Ya‘qūb and Ibrahim b. Ismat, both fair and just narrate from Sarri b. Khuzaymah, from Mu‘alla b. Asad,<sup>2</sup> from Wuhayb b. Khālīd, from Ja‘far b. Muḥammad [i.e. Imam al-Ṣādiq (a)], from his father, from Ali b. al-Ḥusayn, who said: “‘Umar asked Ali for the hand of Umm Kulthūm in marriage and said: “Marry her to me.”

Ali said: “I have kept my daughters for Ja‘far’s son.”

‘Umar said: “Marry her to me, for by Allah, there is no man on earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve!”

Ali married her to ‘Umar.

Then ‘Umar came to the Muhajirun and said: “Don’t you congratulate me?”

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira*, 157 – 165.

<sup>2</sup> In the text of *al-Mustadrak*, it has been recorded as “Mu‘allā ibn Rāshid” which is wrong.

They asked: “With whom are we congratulating you, O Commander of the Faithful?

He replied: “With the daughter of Ali and Fāṭima, daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s). I head the Messenger of Allah (s) say:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مُنْقَطِعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*

I desired to include myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.”

After reporting this narration, Hākim then says: “This tradition is authentic in terms of the chain of transmission, but Bukhari and Muslim have not narrated it.”<sup>1</sup>

#### 4. Al-Bayhaqī's Narrations in al-Sunan al-Kubra

Abū Bakr al-Bayhaqī (d. 457 A.H.) has reported some narrations in this regard which are as follows:

**First narration:** Abū ‘Abdullah, Hāfiz (i.e. Hākim, the author of *al-Mustadrak*) from al-Ḥasan b. Ya‘qūb and Ibrahim b. Ismat, reports that Sarri b. Khuzaymah reported from Mu‘alla b. Asad, he from Wuhayb b. Khālīd who narrated: “Ja‘far b. Muḥammad (i.e. Imam al-Šādiq (a)) reported from his father, he from Ali b. al-Ḥusayn; Likewise from Abul ‘Abbās, Muḥammad b. Ya‘qūb, from Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār, from Yūnus b. Bukayr, from b. Ishāq, from Abū Ja‘far (i.e. Imam al-Bāqir (a)), from his father, from Ali b. al-Ḥusayn that:

“When ‘Umar married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, he came to the Muhajirun between the grave (of

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 3/153, *Ma‘rifat al-Šahaba (Manāqib Amīr al-Mu‘minīn Ali ibn Abī Ṭālib* (peace be upon him), No. 4684).

the Messenger of Allah) and the pulpit where the people in attendance congratulated him and wished him well.”

Addressing the people, ‘Umar said: Behold! I swear by Allah that what impelled me to marry her, was a tradition that I had heard from the Messenger of Allah (s) who said:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مَنقُطَعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*

Upon quoting this narration, al-Bayhaqī says: “This is the text of Ibn Ishāq’s narration, but it is, in terms of the chain of transmission, considered to be *‘mursal’* (hurried or a tradition in which the chain of narrators is omitted) and *hasan* (good). That is because it has also been narrated with a broken chain of transmission.”

**Second narration:** Abū al-Ḥusayn b. Bishran reported from Da‘laj b. Aḥmad, from Mūsa b. Harūn, from Sufyan, from Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ, from Rūh b. Ubadah, from Ibn Jurayj, from Ibn Abī Malika, from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan and he from his father that he said:

‘Umar asked Imam Ali for the hand of Bibi Umm Kulthūm in marriage.

Ali said: “She is too young to be married.”

‘Umar said: “I heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مَنقُطَعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*

I desired to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.”

Ali turned to al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn and said: “Marry Umm Kulthūm to your uncle!”

They said: “Umm Kulthūm, like all other women, is free to choose whomever as husband.”

Ali stood up angrily (!) but al-Ḥasan pulled his lap and said: “We cannot bear to miss you.”

Ali said: “Then marry her to ‘Umar.”<sup>1</sup>

al-Bayhaqī has included this narration again under “The Narrations about Fathers Marrying out Their Virgin Daughters”.<sup>2</sup>

Turkmani, the author of the book of *al-Jawhar al-Naqi*, says: “al-Bayhaqī, in this section of his book, has narrated the marriage of the Prophet and a six-year-old ‘Āisha, the marriage of ‘Umar and Ali’s daughter at a young age, and some of the Prophet’s companions who married out their young daughters.... As for ‘Āisha and Ali’s daughter, they were young (and had not yet reached the age of puberty).

## 5. Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī’s Narrations in *Tārīkh Baghdad*

Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī (d. 463 A.H.) explaining the biography of Ibrahim b. Mahran Marwazi in his *Tārīkh Baghdad*, narrates a tradition with his chain of transmission. The narration reads: Layth b. Sa’d Qaysi, a servant of Bani Rafa’a in the year 171 AH in Egypt, reports from Mūsa b. Ali b. Rabāh al-Lakhmī, from his father, from ‘Uqba b. ‘Āmir al-Juhanī, who narrated:

“‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for the hand of Umm Kulthūm (daughter of Fāṭima) in marriage to himself; he frequently visited Ali’s house on this matter. He told Ali: “O Abul al-Ḥasan, what has made me to come to you time and again is a saying which I heard from the Prophet of Allah (s) that:

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Sunan al-Kubra*, 7/101 and 102 numbers 13393 and 13394.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Sunan al-Kubra*, 7/185 number 13660.

«كُلَّ سَبَبٍ وَنَسَبٍ مَنقُطٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَنَسَبِي»

*'Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.'*

I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.”

Ali stood up and called for his daughter, made her up (!) and then sent her to Amīrul Mu'minin, 'Umar. Seeing Umm Kulthūm, 'Umar stood up and grabbed her ankle and said, 'Tell your father that I am willing, I am willing, I am willing'.

When the girl returned to his father, Ali said: “What did Amīrul Mu'minin say?”

Umm Kulthūm said: “When 'Umar saw me, he called me and kissed me (!), and when I got up to leave, he touched my ankle and said, 'Tell your father that I am willing'.”

Then Ali married her to 'Umar. She gave birth to Zayd b. 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb who lived until he grew old and died.<sup>1</sup>

## 6. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's Narrations in *al-Isti'āb*:

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr Qurtubi (d. 643 A.H.) has also reported some narrations in this regard which are as follows:

**First narration:** Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, was born before the demise of the Prophet of Allah (s). Her mother was Fāṭima Zahrā, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s). 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for her hand in marriage.

Ali said: “She is young.”

'Umar said: “Marry her to me! I shall treat her with dignity more than anyone else.”

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tārīkh Baghdad*, 6/180.

Ali said: "I will send her to you, if you like her, I shall marry her to you."

Ali then sent the girl with a piece of cloth and told her to say [to 'Umar] 'This is the cloth that I was talking about'. She conveyed these words to 'Umar, who said, 'Tell your father that I am pleased and may Allah be pleased with you'. 'Umar then touched the girl's calf pulling aside the garment.

She exclaimed, 'You have done this to me? If it hadn't been for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have broken your nose'. The girl went home and repeated the episode to her father, stating 'You sent me to a bad old man.'

With that Ali said, 'My daughter, he is your husband'.

Thereupon, 'Umar went over to the Muhajirun near the pulpit of the Prophet (s), where the early Muhajirun used to gather. Addressing them, he said: 'Congratulate me.'

They said: "What for, O Amīrul Mu'uminin?"

He said: "I have married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib. I heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

«كُلَّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مِّنْقَطِعُ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبِيَّ وَ نَسَبِي»

*'Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.'*

I was related to the Prophet (s) but I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage."

The Muhajirun congratulated him.

**Second narration:** 'Abdul Warith reports from Qasim, from Khushani, from Ibn Abī 'Umar, from Sufyan, from Amr b. Dinar, from Muḥammad (Ibn Hanafiyya) the son of Ali, who narrates: 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali for her daughter's

hand (Umm Kulthūm) in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

They told ‘Umar: "Ali has rejected you."

‘Umar returned to Ali to ask again for his daughter’s hand in marriage. Ali said: "I will send her to you, if you like her, she will be your wife."

Then Ali sent her daughter to ‘Umar, and ‘Umar pulled away the cloth from her calf (!). Umm Kulthūm said: "Take off your hands! Were it not for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have blinded you."

**Third narration:** Ibn Wahab reports from ‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Zayd b. Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather who narrates that: "‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib with a dowry of four thousand dirham!"

**Fourth narration:** Abū ‘Umar says: "Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, gave birth to two children named Zayd and Ruqayya from ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb. She and her son Zayd died on the same day."

Zayd was injured in a battle which took place overnight among Bani ‘Adī clan. He had gone to settle the dispute between the warring parties when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. A while later he died, his death coinciding with the death of his mother.

Ibn ‘Umar prayed on both of them at the request of al-Ḥasan b. Ali.

As they say: "Two traditions were performed about these two people:

1. None of them inherited from the other, since it was not clear who passed away first.

2. Zayd's corpse was placed in front of his mother's corpse on the side where the prayer leader stood.<sup>1</sup>

## 7. Ibn Athīr's Narrations in *Usd al-Ghabah*

Ibn Athīr Jazari (d. 630 A.H.) has also related some narrations in this regard in his book titled *Usd al-ghabah*. His narrations are as follows:

**First narration:** Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib and Fāṭima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s) was born before the demise of the Holy Prophet (s).

‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for his daughter's hand in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

‘Umar said: "There is no man who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve."

Ali said: "I will send her to you and if you are pleased, I shall marry her to you."

Then Ali sent Umm Kulthūm to ‘Umar with a piece of cloth instructing her to tell ‘Umar that it was the cloth he was talking about."

Umm Kulthūm conveyed ‘Umar her father's message. ‘Umar told her: "I am pleased, may Allah be pleased with you." He then touched her!

"Why are you doing this?" Umm Kulthūm objected. "Had it not been for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have broken your nose."

Then she went home and repeated the episode to her father, stating 'You sent me to a foul old man.'

With that Ali said, "My daughter, he is your husband."

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Isti'āb*, 4/509 & 510.



Thereupon, 'Umar went to the place of the Muhajirun near the pulpit of the Prophet (s), where the early Muhajirun used to gather. He sat beside them and said: "Congratulate me."

They said: "What for, O Amīrul Mu'uminin?"

He said: "I have married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Tālib. I heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَنَسَبٍ مَنقُطٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَنَسَبِي»

*'Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.'*

I was related to the Prophet (s) but I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage."

Then the Muhajirun congratulated him.

'Umar married Umm Kulthūm with a dowry of forty thousand dirham! The fruit of this marriage was two children named Zayd son of the Greater 'Umar and Ruqayya. Umm Kulthūm and her son, Zayd, died on the same day.

Zayd was injured in the battle which took place overnight among Bani 'Adī clan. He had gone to solve a dispute between the two warring sides when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. Zayd was alive for a while but then he breathed his last on the same day on which his mother died.

Ibn 'Umar prayed on both of them on al-Ḥasan b. Ali's request.

When 'Umar was killed, 'Awn b. Ja'far married Umm Kulthūm!

**Second narration:** 'Abdul Wahab b. Ali b. Ali Amin reports from Abū Fadhl Muḥammad b. Nāsir, from Khaṭīb Abū Tahir Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Abī Saqar, from Abul Barakāt Aḥmad b. 'Abdul Wāhid b. Fadhl b. Nazif b.

‘Abdullah Farrā’ who narrates that he told Aḥmad: “Has Abū Muḥammad al-Ḥasan b. Rashiḡ narrated to you?”

He said: “Yes, Abū Bushr Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Hammad al-Dūlābī reported from Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār, from Yūnus b. Bukayr, from Ibn Ishāq, from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan b. Ali b. Abī Ṭālib who said:

“When Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib (a) was widowed of ‘Umar, her brothers al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn went to her saying: “You are known as the chief of Muslim women and the daughter of the best lady. We swear by Allah that if you leave your decision to Ali, he will definitely marry you to one of his orphans (!) and if you wish to get ample wealth (!!), you will definitely get it.”

I swear by Allah, no sooner did they stand up than Ali arrived while he was leaning on his walking stick. Praising and thanking Allah, he reminded them of their status and dignity to the Prophet of Allah (s) and said: "O children of Fāṭima, you are aware of your status and dignity and you know well that I have given you priority over my other children owing to your position and relationship to the Messenger of Allah (s)."

They said: "You are right, may Allah bless you and may He reward you on our behalf."

Ali turned to his daughter and said: “My daughter, Allah has granted you the authority to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you to leave that to me.”

Umm Kulthūm said: “Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations of other women (!!), I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women; I wish to decide for myself what I should do regarding this matter.”

Ali said: "My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your opinion but it is that of these two!"

Then he stood up and said: "You will either do this or you will never talk to any of these two!"

al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn grabbed their father's lap and said: "Dear father, sit down. By Allah, we cannot bear to miss you."

Turning to Umm Kulthūm, they said: "Leave your matter to him."

"I have done so," Umm Kulthūm answered.

Ali said: "I will marry you to 'Awn b. Ja'far, who is an adolescent."

Thereupon, Ali returned to Umm Kulthūm giving her four thousand dirham and sending her to 'Awn.

This narration has also been reported by Abū 'Umar.<sup>1</sup>

### 8. Ibn Ḥajar's Narrations in *al-Iṣābah*

Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, who died in the year 852 A.H., has also reported some narrations in this regard. They are as under:

**First narration:** Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib was a descendant of Hashim, her mother was Fāṭima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s). She was born during the lifetime of the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.

Abū 'Umar says, "She was born before the demise of the Holy Prophet (s)."

Ibn Abī 'Umar Maqdisi says: "Sufyan reported from 'Umar, from Muḥammad b. Ali [Imam al-Bāqir (a)] that he said that

---

<sup>1</sup> *Usd al-Ghāba*, 7/377 & 378.

‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali for her daughter’s hand (Umm Kulthūm) in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

They told ‘Umar, “Ali has rejected you.”

‘Umar returned to Ali to ask again for his daughter’s hand in marriage. Ali said: “I will send her to you, if you like her, she will be your wife.”

Then Ali sent her daughter to ‘Umar who pulled away the cloth from her calf! Umm Kulthūm said: “Take off your hands! Were it not for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have blinded you.”

**Second narration:** Ibn Wahab reports from ‘Abdul Raḥmān Ibn Zayd Ibn Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather who narrates that ‘Umar married Umm Kulthūm with a dowry of forty thousand dirham!

**Third narration:** Zubayr says: “Umm Kulthūm bore two children from ‘Umar by the names of Zayd and Ruqayya. Umm Kulthūm passed away on the same day as her son.

Zayd was injured during the battle that took place among Bani ‘Adī, where he had gone to settle a dispute between the warring parties when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. His mother was also sick, and they both died on the same day.”

**Fourth narration:** In his *al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira* Abū Bushr al-Dūlābī narrates on the authority of Ibn Ishāq:

al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan b. Ali says: “When ‘Umar, the husband of Umm Kulthūm died and she was widowed of him, her brothers al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn went to her and said to her: “If you yourself make your decision and want to get substantial wealth, you shall definitely get it.” Then Ali walked into the house, thanked and praised Allah and said: “My daughter, Allah has granted you the authority to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you leave the matter to me.”

Umm Kulthūm said: “Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations and desires of all other women and I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women do.”

Ali said: “My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your view; rather it is that of these two!”

Then he stood up and said: “You either do this or I will never talk to any of these two!”

They surrounded Umm Kulthūm and wanted her to accept the proposal. She accepted and got married to ‘Awn b. Ja‘far.

**Fifth narration:** Dār Qutnī has referred to Umm Kulthūm in *al-Ikhwah* and has said:

“When ‘Awn died, his brother Muḥammad married Umm Kulthūm! After a while, ‘Awn too died whereupon his brother ‘Abdullah married her (!) and Umm Kulthūm died in ‘Abdullah's house.

Ibn Sa‘d has also reported a narration similar to the above saying at the end: Umm Kulthūm used to refer to the incident saying: “I feel ashamed of Asma bint ‘Umayy whose two sons died when they were in my company, and I am worried about the third one.”

Umm Kulthūm died in ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far’s house and did not bear a child with anyone of them.

**Sixth narration:** Ibn Sa‘d reports from Anas Ibn ‘Ayad, from Ja‘far b. Muḥammad, from his father who said:

“‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb asked Ali for his daughter’s hand in marriage. Ali said: ‘I have kept my daughters for the sons of Ja‘far.’

‘Umar said: “Marry her to me, for by Allah, there is no man on earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.”

Ali said: "I have accepted."

‘Umar went to the place of the Muhajirun and told them: "Congratulate me."

They congratulated him, and asked: "Whom have you married?"

He replied: "I have married the daughter of Ali b. Abī Tālib."

Indeed, the Prophet of Allah (s) said:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَنَسَبٍ مُنْقَطِعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَنَسَبِي»

*‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’*

I had given the Prophet a daughter, but I also loved to (marry a daughter from his family)."<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *al-Iṣāba*, 8/464 and 465.

# **2**

## **A Study of the Chains of Transmission of the Narrations**

## A Study of the Chains of Transmission of the Narrations

The narrations that you went through were the most important ones that have been passed on by Sunni Muslims' narrators in their most famous books. Some of these narrations relate to the allegation that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) married his daughter to 'Umar. Some relate to the marriage of Umm Kulthūm after 'Umar's death and others relate to the event of her death and her son.

Based on Sunni Muslims' rules and principles in the science of hadith (tradition) and relying on the sayings of their scholars in *'ilm al-rijāl* [the science of narrators], if one carefully examines the chains of the transmission of these narrations, he will come to know that the story in its entirety is baseless and unsubstantiated let alone the small details and incidents in connection with it?<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> We can divide the narrators of these narrations into two groups:

a) People who have been weakened (considered as unreliable) and accused of lying by Sunni scholars.

b) People who are trusted by Sunni scholars, but their hatred and malice towards the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) was an obvious and indisputable historical reality.

It is pertinent to mention that, the narrations from this group of narrators – especially those against Ali b. Abī Ṭālib (a) – are not acceptable to Shī'a.



Now, before verifying the chains, we shall remind you of a few points concerning these narrations:

1. The stories that you went through in the previous section have not been reported in the two well-known and so-called authentic books, namely *Sahih Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim*. The authors of these two books have disregarded these narrations not mentioning them in their books.

2. These narrations have also not been narrated in the other Sunni books which are widely known as *Siḥāḥ Sittah*. Hence, all the authors of the six so-called authentic books have disregarded these traditions and agreed not to narrate them.

3. This story has not been related in other hadith books such as *Musnad* of Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal. He and a group of his followers maintained that anything that is not recorded in this book – *Musnad Aḥmad* – is not authentic.<sup>1</sup>

It is worth noting that in many cases, Sunni scholars dealing with different topics do not present their arguments with reliance on the narrations which are authentic simply because Bukhari and Muslim have not narrated them in their books or that they have not been recorded in the other *Siḥāḥ* books!

### **The Focal Point in this Regard**

The focal point that can be mentioned in this regard is that this story has been narrated by their narrators from the Shia Imams, the Ahl al-Bayt (a). The above narrations have been transmitted in the books of *al-Ṭabaqāt* of b. Saʿd, *al-Mustadrak* of Hākim, *al-Sunan al-Kubra* of al-Bayhaqī and *al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhirah* of al-Dūlābī.

Two points must be noted concerning these narrations.

---

<sup>1</sup> Cf. *Nafaḥāt al- Azhār*, 2/27 and next.

**The first point:** Following years of studying and reviewing Sunni Muslims' narrations, we have found out that when Sunnis and the opponents of the Ahl al-Bayt (a) wanted to relate a narration to the Ahl al-Bayt (a) which is in no way in harmony with those noble men's opinion and doctrine, they have always embarked on fabricating a narration ascribing it to one of the members of the pure progeny of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his descendants.

When they wanted to find a fault with Allah's Prophet (s) and his noble daughter, Fāṭima Zahrā (a) as well as his successor Amīr al-Mu'minīn Ali (a), they made up a story ascribing a saying to the Ahl al-Bayt that they said that, for example, Ali (a) sought marriage to the daughter of Abū Jahl.<sup>1</sup>

When they wanted to propagate the prohibition of temporary marriage they made every effort to criticize Ibn 'Abbās, who until the last moment of his life believed that temporary marriage was lawful. Thus, they forged a narration forbidding the temporary marriage and quoting a saying from Ali (a) reprimanding and taunting Ibn 'Abbās for believing in the permissibility of temporary marriage. They also fabricated traditions which they narrated from his sons.<sup>2</sup>

When they wanted to fabricate a tradition on the merits of the companions, they made this tradition imputing it to Imam Ja'far al-Ṣādiq (a) that he said that the companions were like stars.<sup>3</sup>

Therefore, there is no doubt that the story of Umm Kulthūm's marriage to 'Umar is a fabricated story which has no sound basis at all.

---

<sup>1</sup> Refer to the treatise that we have written concerning this subject.

<sup>2</sup> See the research work that we have written concerning this topic.

<sup>3</sup> See the book that we have written concerning this topic.

**The second point:** Sunnis have narrated this story from Imam al-Ṣādiq (a), from his father as narrated in Ibn Saʿd's *al-Ṭabaqāt* or from Imam al-Ṣādiq (a), from his father, from Imam Sajjād (a) as narrated in *al-Mustadrak* or from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan as narrated in *al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira* or from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan, from his father as narrated by al-Bayhaqī in his *al-Sunan al-Kubra*.

Therefore, if Sunni Muslims' aim of quoting these narrations is to base their argument on them to prove their side of the story on the basis of their own standards and principles, then it depends on the authenticity of the narration according to them.

It is not possible to use the foregoing narrations on the authority of the Ahl al-Bayt (a) because Ibn Saʿd, the writer of *al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra* has spoken insolently and disrespectfully of Imam al-Ṣādiq (a) saying:

“He has several narrations that cannot be used to argue with since they are weak and unreliable. He was once asked: Did you hear these narrations from your father?”

He said: “Yes.”

He was asked again and he said: “I found them in my father's book.”<sup>1</sup>

Likewise, in his *al-Mustadrak*, Hākim al-Nīshābūrī narrates a tradition from Imam Sajjād (a) on the authority of Imam al-Ṣādiq (a) considering it to be authentic. Commenting on that tradition, al-Dhahabī says: “The chain of transmission of this narration is disconnected and broken.”<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 2/94.

<sup>2</sup> *Talkhīṣ al-Mustadrak*, 3/142.

Concerning that narration, al-Bayhaqī, says: “This narration is ‘*mursal*’ (hurried or a hadith one or more transmitters of which are left out or omitted.”<sup>1</sup>

The narration that has been narrated from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan in *al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira*, is also similar to this. On top of that, its narrators have been weakened as shall soon be clarified. Certainly, there is no interruption in the narrations transmitted in al-Bayhaqī’s *al-Sunan al-Kubra* from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan, from his father but their chains of transmission lack authenticity and credibility especially because the narrator narrates this tradition from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan b. Abī Malika. We shall provide the details soon.

On the other hand, if their aim of relating these narrations is to make Shiites accept them, simply because they have been narrated from the Ahl al-Bayt (a) through those who narrated traditions from the Holy Messenger of Allah (s), such an effort depends on the fact that the followers of Ahl al-Bayt (a) should verify and authenticate the transmitters of these narrations according to their own viewpoint, and this is the beginning of the debate between Shi’ism and the Sunni branch of Islam.

Hence, the most important narrations which Sunni Muslims have made recourse to and pointed out in their books are verified and proven unreliable and unauthentic. (By extension, other relevant narrations would be void and inauthentic).

Notwithstanding this, we shall have a lengthy discussion in this regard. To begin with, we shall discuss the chain of the transmission of the narration that has been narrated in *al-Sunan al-Kubra* of al-Bayhaqī, from Imam al-Bāqir (a) and from his respected father Imam Sajjād (a) and in *al-Istī‘āb*, from Imam al-Bāqir (a) and in *al-Sunan al-Kubra* from al-

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Sunan al-Kubra*, 7/102.

Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan. Then we shall study their isnād (documentation) and chains of the transmission of the other narrations so as to draw up a conclusion and to expose the opponents by concrete arguments and proofs. On this basis, we say:

Al-Bayhaqī has reported this narration in *al-Sunan al-Kubra* from Ḥākim al-Nīshābūrī, from Imam al-Bāqir (a), from his father Imam Sajjād (a). The point is that Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār is also present in the chain of the transmission of the narration, and we shall now study his biography.

### **Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār as Seen by Biographers**

Some comments made by biographers concerning Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār are as follows:

Ibn Abī Ḥātim says: “I have written many narrations reported by Aḥmad, but because a lot of people are speaking [highly of] him, I have refrained from narrating them.”

Ibn Mu‘īn says: “He used to lie.”

Abū Aḥmad Ḥākim also says about him: “Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār is weak according to biographers. That is why Ibn ‘Uqdah has disregarded his narrations.”

Ibn ‘Adī also says about him: “The people of Iraq unanimously consider him weak (unreliable).”<sup>1</sup>

### **Yūnus b. Bukayr as Seen by Biographers**

Yūnus b. Bukayr is also in the chain of the transmitters of the narrations. Some biographers’ sayings about him are as follows:

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 1/47.

Ājurī, from Abī Dāwūd narrated that Yūnus b. Bukayr is not trustworthy according to him. He used to take a clause from Ibn Ishāq's sayings and attach it to the traditions.

Al-Nasā'ī says about him: "Yūnus is not good in narrating traditions." He has also been reported as having said: "Yūnus is weak in terms of narrating traditions."

Jawzjānī says about Yūnus: "It is appropriate to look into his work carefully."

Sājī says: "Ibn Madīnī never transmitted narrations from Yūnus, nevertheless, he is counted among the honest narrators by Sunni Muslims."

Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal says about him: "The people hated and detached themselves from no one as much as they hated and detached themselves from him."

Ibn Abī Shayba says: "He had a weak character."

Sājī says: "Yūnus was a truthful person, the only flaw with him was that he used to follow the rulers and he was a follower of the 'Murji'a'<sup>1</sup> sect.<sup>2</sup>

### **'Amr b. Dīnār as Seen by Biographers**

This narration has also been quoted by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr and Ibn Ḥajar on the authority of Imam al-Bāqir (a) with 'Amr b. Dīnār being present in the chain of the transmission. We have mentioned below comments made by some biographers about him:

---

<sup>1</sup> Murji'a was a group of Muslims who proclaimed: "No sin is harmful with faith."

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 11/383.

Maymunī narrates from Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal that ‘Amr b. Dīnār is weak in terms of transmitting narrations and that he was a reporter of weak [munkar] traditions.

Ishāq b. Maṣṣūr narrates from Ibn Ma‘īn that he is not noteworthy from a biographical perspective. Ya‘qūb b. Shaybah has also narrated from Ibn Ma‘īn that he said that ‘Amr b. Dīnār is a *‘dhāhib al-hadith*<sup>1</sup>.

‘Amr b. Ali says about him: “The narrations from ‘Amr are weak in terms of transmission.” He narrated *munkar* [literally denounced]<sup>2</sup> traditions from Sālim, from Ibn ‘Umar, from the Messenger of Allah (s).

Abū Ḥātim has narrated the same: “All of his narrations are denounced.”

Abū Zur‘a says about ‘Amr: “His narrations are useless.”

Bukhari says: “He is a man who should be looked at with skepticism and hesitation.”

Abū Dāwūd says about his narrations: “They are not noteworthy.”

Tirmidhī says: “He is not strong in terms of transmitting traditions.”

Al-Nasā’ī declares his opinion about ‘Amr by saying: “He is not reliable since he has narrated denounced traditions from Sālim.”

Elsewhere, he says: “He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions.”

---

<sup>1</sup> Meaning the traditions transmitted by him are worthless.

<sup>2</sup> *Munkar*, (مُنْكَر), literally means 'denounced'. If a narration which goes against another authentic hadith is reported by a weak narrator, it is known as *munkar*.

Jawzjānī and Dār Quṭnī have made similar remarks about him.

Ibn Ḥibbān says: “Whoever looks at his writings, becomes surprised; he narrated *Mawḍū‘a*<sup>1</sup> traditions from trustworthy narrators.”

In the book of *al-Awsat*, Bukhari also writes as such about him: “His narrations can neither be acted upon nor can they be considered authentic.”

Ibn ‘Ammār al-Mawṣilī says about ‘Amr: “He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions.”

Sāji also makes a similar remark saying: “He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions for he has narrated denounced traditions from Sālim.”<sup>2</sup>

These were some of the remarks made by biographers concerning ‘Amr b. Dīnār. The conclusion is that the narration which he has transmitted in connection with the subject matter is worthless. What is more, Sufyān b. ‘Uyayna is also in the chain of these narrators.

### **Sufyān b. ‘Uyayna as Seen by Biographers**

Al-Bayhaqī has also reported this narration from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan, from his noble father (s). Among the people in the chain of the transmission of the tradition is Sufyān b. ‘Uyayna. What follows is what some biographers have some commented on him:

Ibn ‘Ammār says: ‘I heard Yahya b. Sa‘īd Qaṭṭān saying: “Bear witness that Sufyān b. ‘Uyayna lost his mind in the

---

<sup>1</sup> *Hadīth Mawḍū‘a*, a tradition fabricated by the narrator and falsely ascribed to Prophet Muhammad (s) or his descendants, peace be upon them.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 8/27.



year 197 AH. Therefore, whoever heard a narration from him in this year or in the following years, cannot be trusted.”

After quoting Ibn ‘Ammār, while answering the question of al-Dhahabī, Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī says: “This has been reported by al-Dhahabī only because Ibn ‘Ammār is among the trusted intellectuals. There would be no problem if Yahya b. Sa‘īd heard it from a group of pilgrims in that year and testified it simply because he trusted them due to the fact that there were many people who reported the same.”

I found a saying from Yahya b. Sa‘īd that can constitute a reason why Ibn ‘Ammār narrated from him, concerning Ibn ‘Uyayna. While elaborating on the biography of Ismā‘īl b. Abī Ṣālṭh Mu’adhin, in *Tārīkh Baghdad*, Abū Sa‘d Sam‘āni narrates, with a strong chain of transmission from ‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Bushr b. Ḥakam, that he heard Yahya b. Sa‘īd saying: “I told Ibn ‘Uyayna: “You have written traditions but when you narrate them these days, you add and omit something from their chains of transmission!”

He said: “You should obtain the traditions in the same way as you heard them earlier, because I have become old now.”

Abū Mu‘īn Rāzī writes as part of the annotations which he has written on Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal’s *al-Imān*: “Hārūn b. Ma‘rūf told Aḥmad: Ibn ‘Uyayna’s health had deteriorated during the last moments of his life.” Sulaymān b. Ḥarb also told him: “Ibn ‘Uyayna has made a lot of mistakes in most of the narrations that he has reported from Ayyūb.”<sup>1</sup>

### **Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ as Seen by Biographers**

Another narrator who has transmitted this narration is Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ. In his *Mizān al-Itidāl*, al-Dhahabī quotes Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal about Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ’s

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*: 4/108 and 109.

untrustworthiness and unreliability as a reporter because he used to curse the predecessors, drink intoxicants and give false verdicts.<sup>1</sup>

Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī narrates on the authority of Naʿīm b. Ḥammād that he had his dinner – or breakfast – with Wakīʿ. Wakīʿ said: “Which one do you like me to bring you, old men’s special *nabiz* (*wine* of raisins or dates) or young men’s special *nabiz*?”

I said: “Do you speak of such things?”

He said: “I believe this is more ḥalāl (permissible) than the Euphrates’ water.”<sup>2</sup>

Ibn Ḥajar reports from Aḥmad that Wakīʿ had erred in as many as five hundred traditions.<sup>3</sup>

He has reported from Muḥammad b. Naṣr al-Marwazī that in the last days of his life, Wakīʿ used to narrate traditions from his own mind changing his sentences.<sup>4</sup>

### **Ibn Jurayj as Seen by Biographers**

Ibn Jurayj too, is one of the transmitters of this tradition. Regarding him, Ibn Ḥajar writes: Mālik says: “When it comes to narrating a tradition, Ibn Jurayj is like someone collecting firewood in the darkness.”<sup>5</sup>

Ibn Muʿīn says: “The narrations that he has narrated from Zuhri are not worthy of attention.”

---

<sup>1</sup> *Mizān al-iʿtidāl*, 7/127.

<sup>2</sup> *Tārīkh Baghdad*, 13/477.

<sup>3</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 11/111.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid*, 11/114.

<sup>5</sup> This phrase is used in scientific books to make a sarcastic remark about mixing up of the right and wrong and truth and falsehood.

Aḥmad says: “When Ibn Jurayj says: “Someone said”, and “I am reporting”, he is in fact narrating a denounced [*munkar*] narration.”

Yahya b. Sa‘īd says: “Whenever Ibn Jurayj says that someone (or so and so) said, it is like he is speaking out his own mind [he is not reporting from anyone].”

Ibn Madīnī says: “I asked Yahya b. Sa‘īd concerning the narrations reported by Ibn Jurayj from ‘Aṭā al-Khurāsānī.”

He said: “His narrations are weak.”

I told Yahya: “Ibn Jurayj says that ‘Aṭā al-Khurāsānī reported to him.”

Yahya said: “His words are not noteworthy; they are all weak. ‘Aṭā has given him a book only.”

Ibn Ḥibbān says: “Ibn Jurayj used to practice ‘*tadlis*’<sup>1</sup> (concealing).”

Dār Quṭnī says: “Keep away from the concealing and deceit of Ibn Jurayj since his *tadlis* [concealing] is loathsome.”<sup>2</sup>

Concerning Ibn Jurayj’s personality, al-Dhahabī writes in his *Mizān al-I’tidāl*: “He used to practice *tadlis* in narrating traditions.”<sup>3</sup>

In this regard, Ibn Ḥajar says: “Ibn Jurayj used to practice *tadlis* in narrating narrations and used to narrate traditions by

---

<sup>1</sup> A person reports from his shaykh whom he met, what he did not hear from him, or from a contemporary of his whom he did not meet, in such a way as to create the impression that he heard the ḥadīth in person. A *mudallis* (one who practices *tadlis*) here usually uses the mode (“on the authority of”) or (“he said”) to conceal the truth about the isnād.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 6/354 and 355.

<sup>3</sup> *Mizān al-i’tidāl*, 4/404.

way of *irsal* (the absence of the link between the successor and the Prophet).”<sup>1</sup>

Most importantly, Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal says about him: “Some of the narrations that Ibn Jurayj has narrated by way of *irsal* are forged. It was not important for him as to where he was narrating from.”<sup>2</sup>

### **Ibn Abī Malīka as Seen by Biographers**

His name is ‘Abdullah b. ‘Ubaydullah and it is enough to say about him being untrustworthy that he was Ibn Zubayr’s judge and a special ‘*mu’adhdhin*’ (one who calls people to prayer) of his.<sup>3</sup>

Now we shall once again look back at the tradition and see the narrators in the chain of transmission of the tradition which he has reported.

In the narrations of Ibn Sa‘d and the narrations that Ibn Ḥajar has narrated from Ibn Abī Malīka in *al-Iṣāba*, there is Wakī‘ b. al-Jarrāḥ whom we became familiar with through the details provided above.

### **Hushām b. Sa‘d as Seen by Biographers**

One of the narrators is Hushām b. Sa‘d about whom al-Dhahabī writes in his *Mizān al-ʿitidāl*:

Aḥmad has said about him: “Hushām was not a memorizer.”<sup>4</sup> On the other hand, Yaḥya b. Qaṭṭān did not narrate from him.”

---

<sup>1</sup> *Taqrīb al-Tahdhīb*, 1/617.

<sup>2</sup> *Mizān al-ʿitidāl*, 4/404.

<sup>3</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 5/272.

<sup>4</sup> According to some scholars, a memorizer in the science of *dirāya* (biography) and traditions is said to be a person who has memorized one hundred traditions together with their chains of transmission.

Al-Dhahabī further writes: “On another occasion, Aḥmad says: “There is no sound and authentic tradition among Hushām’s reports.”

Concerning him, Ibn Mu‘īn says: “His traditions are neither strong nor ignorable.”

Al-Nasā’ī describes him as such: “Hushām is weak in narrating traditions.” In another statement, he says: “Hushām was not strong in terms of narrating traditions.”

Ibn ‘Adī says about him: “Although Hushām was weak in terms of narrating traditions, they are worth writing down and recording.”

Ibn Ḥajar says about him: “Al-Dowrī narrated from Ibn Mu‘īn that Hushām is weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

Commenting on him, Abū Hātim also says: “The traditions of Hushām are written but they lack the capacity to be used for argumentation or evidence-based reasoning.”

Al-Dhahabī adds: “Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has mentioned his name among the people who are counted as weak but whose narrations are written, and Ya‘qūb b. Sufyān has also considered him to be among the weak.”

Ibn Sa‘d says about Hushām: “He used to narrate a lot of traditions but he was generally considered to be weak; he was inclined towards Shi‘ism.<sup>1</sup>

### **Ibn Wahab as Seen by Biographers**

Ibn Wahab’s name has also appeared in the narration that Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr and Ibn Ḥajar have narrated with their own

---

<sup>1</sup> *Mizān al-i‘tidāl*, 7/81 and *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*: 11/37 and 38.

*isnād*<sup>1</sup> from Aslam, the freed slave of ‘Umar. Now, we shall see who he is and what biographers have said about him.

Ibn Wahab is that same ‘Abdullah b. Wahab al-Qurashi who is Egyptian by origin but was allied with the Quraysh.

Ibn ‘Adī and al-Dhahabī have recorded his name in *al-Kāmil fī al-Ḍu‘afā*<sup>2</sup> and *Mizān al-I‘tidāl* respectively.<sup>3</sup>

Ibn Mu‘īn has also said something about him with intention of reproaching him.<sup>4</sup>

Ibn Sa‘d says concerning Ibn Wahab: “He used to practice *tadlis*.”<sup>5</sup> That is, he concealed the truth about the *isnād* of the tradition to create an impression that he had heard the ḥadith in person.

Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal says about him: “The traditions which Ibn Wahab has narrated from Ibn Jurayj need to be examined and reflected upon (for they may not be true).”

Confirming what Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal has said about Ibn Wahab, Abū ‘Awāna says: “Aḥmad has said the truth, because Ibn Wahab has transmitted reports which none other than him has reported.”<sup>6</sup>

### **Mūsa b. Ali al-Lakhmī as Seen by Biographers**

Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī has reported this narration with his own *isnād* from Layth b. Sa‘d, from Mūsa b. Ali b. Rabāh al-

<sup>1</sup> The chain of authorities attesting to the historical authenticity of a particular *ḥ*adith.

<sup>2</sup> *al-Kāmil fī al-Ḍu‘afā*: 5/336.

<sup>3</sup> *Mizān al-i‘tidāl*, 4/223.

<sup>4</sup> *al-Kāmil fī al-Ḍu‘afā*, 5/336 and 337 and *Mizān al-i‘tidāl*: 4/223 and 224.

<sup>5</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 6/67 and 68.

<sup>6</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 6/67 and 68.

Lakhmī, from his father, from ‘Uqba b. ‘Āmir al-Juhanī who are all certifiable in terms of trustworthiness and reliability.

According to al-Suyūṭī: “Mūsa b. al-Lakhmī was the governor of Egypt from 155 until 161 A.H.”<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Ḥajar says about him: “Mūsa took over the governorship of Egypt in the year 161 AH.”<sup>2</sup>

Al-Sam‘ānī says concerning Mūsa al-Lakhmī: “He was the governor of Egypt.”<sup>3</sup>

Ibn Mu‘īn has commented on him by saying: “Mūsa is not good in narrating tradition.”

Regarding Mūsa al-Lakhmī, Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr writes: “The narrations that Mūsa has narrated alone are not strong.”<sup>4</sup>

### **Ali b. Rabāh al-Lakhmī as Seen by Biographers**

Ibn Ḥajar has studied Ali al-Lakhmī’s life and made reference to certain facts about him in his book in which he writes:

1. He came to Mu‘āwīyya as a representative.
2. He used to say: “I shall not pardon whoever named me ‘Ali’ because my name is ‘Ulay.”
3. He was treated with respect by ‘Abdul ‘Azīz (the son of Marwan and brother of ‘Abdul Mālīk who was for some time the governor of Egypt) until a time when ‘Abdul ‘Azīz got angry at him and sent him to a battle in Africa. He remained there in Africa until he died there.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *Husn al-Muhādḍara*, 2/12.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 10/323.

<sup>3</sup> *A-Ansāb* 5/134.

<sup>4</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 10/323.

<sup>5</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 7/271 and 272.

### ‘Uqba b. Āmir al-Juhanī as Seen by Biographers

‘Uqba has been criticized and considered unreliable by many biographers:

1. He was one of the governors and agents of Mu‘āwiyya b. Abī Sufyān. Sam‘ānī says: “‘Uqba was present during the conquest of Egypt and he got the measurement of that area. In the year 44, after the death of ‘Utba son of Abū Sufyān, he served as the commander of Mu‘āwiyya’s army in Egypt. Then in the year 47, Mu‘āwiyya dispatched him for a maritime combat.”<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Ḥajar says about ‘Uqba: “He was appointed governor of Egypt by Mu‘āwiyya in the year 44 AH.”<sup>2</sup>

Al-Suyūṭī has also said the same thing about him.<sup>3</sup>

2. He was the murderer – or one of the murderers – of ‘Ammār b. Yasir. In this regard, Ibn Sa‘d writes: “‘Ammār (may Allah bless him) was killed at the age of 91. He had been born before the Prophet of Allah (s). In the Battle of Siffin, ‘Ammār was confronted by three people; ‘Uqba b. Āmir al-Juhanī, ‘Umar b. Harith Khulānī and Sharik b. Salamah Murādi. When they had surrounded him, ‘Ammār told them: “I swear by Allah, if you attack me and push us back as far as to Ḥajar palm grove, I would still be sure that we are on the right side and you are not.”

It was then that they attacked and killed him. Some people thought that ‘Uqba b. Āmir had killed ‘Ammār.

3. He was the man who bate up ‘Ammār by the order of Uthmān.

---

<sup>1</sup> Al-Ansāb, 2/134.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 7/209 and 210.

<sup>3</sup> *Husn al-Muhādḍara*, 2/8.



After the above account of the conversation, Ibn Sa'd says: "Uqba is the person who beat 'Ammār at the behest of 'Uthmān b. 'Affān."<sup>1</sup>

Based on the foregoing account, we do not see any need to examine the biographies of Laith b. Sa'd and other people in Khaṭīb al-Baghḏādī's chain of the transmitters of the narration.

### 'Aṭā al-Khurāsānī as Seen by Biographers

One of the narrators of this narration is 'Aṭā al-Khurāsānī. Bukhari has mentioned him in the book titled *al-Ḍu'afā al-Ṣaghīr*.<sup>2</sup>

'Ibn Ḥibbān has made mention of him in *al-Majrūhīn*.<sup>3</sup> Al-'Uqaylī has mentioned his name in his book titled *al-Ḍu'afā al-Kabīr*.<sup>4</sup>

al-Dhahabī has provided 'Aṭā al-Khurāsānī's biographical details in two of his books namely *Mizān al-'itidāl* and *al-Mughnī fī al-Ḍu'afā*.<sup>5</sup>

Sam'ānī says about 'Aṭā al-Khurāsānī: "He was a man of bad memory, had a lot of mistakes, erred unknowingly and these narrations were transmitted from him. When these problems were noted with his narrations, they were no longer used as proofs and reasons as they were considered worthless and unacceptable."<sup>6</sup>

In addition, there is interruption and disconnection with this narration of his because 'Aṭā was born in the year 50 and he died in the year 133 or 150 of the Islamic calendar. Therefore

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra*, 3/196.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Ḍu'afā al-Ṣaghīr*, 178 and 179.

<sup>3</sup> The book of *al-Majruhin*, 2/130 and 131.

<sup>4</sup> *Al-Ḍu'afā al-Kabīr*, 3/405.

<sup>5</sup> *Mizān al-'itidāl*, 5/92, *al-Mughnī fī al-Ḍu'afā*, 2/59.

<sup>6</sup> *Al-Ansāb*, 2/337.

he must have narrated these narrations from someone else whose name he has not mentioned.

### **Muḥammad b. ‘Umar al-Wāqidī as Seen by Biographers**

One of the narrators who have reported this narration is Muḥammad b. ‘Umar al-Wāqidī. Biographers have also talked a lot about him:

Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal says: “He is a great liar and a person who tampers with narrations.”

Bukhari and Abū Ḥātim say: “Muḥammad b. ‘Umar is an obsolete person.”

Likewise Abū Ḥātim and Al-Nasā’ī have said: “He used to forge narrations.”

Ibn Rāhwayh says: “In my opinion, he is one of those who fabricated narrations.”

Ibn Mu‘īn says: “He is not a reliable and trustworthy person.”

Dār Quṭnī says: “He has a weak character in terms of narrating traditions.”

Ibn ‘Adī says: “Traditions transmitted by him are not protected and coherent; evil and complications arise from them.”

Sam‘ānī says: “Much has been said about him.”

Ibn Khallakān says: “The biographers have weakened him in terms of narrating traditions and they have said a lot concerning him.”

Al-Yāfī’ī says: “Prominent traditionists have considered him weak.”

Al-Dhahabī says: “There is an all out agreement about disregarding his narrations.”<sup>1</sup>

### ‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Zayd as Seen by Biographers

Another person who has narrated this tradition is ‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Zayd. Abū Ṭālib says: “Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal said concerning ‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Zayd: “He is weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

‘Abdullah b. Aḥmad says: I heard my father disparaging ‘Abdul Raḥmān and saying: “He narrates denounced traditions.”

Al-Dowrī says: “Ibn Mu‘īn says about ‘Abdul Raḥmān: “His narrations are not noteworthy.”

Bukhari and Abū Ḥātim say about him: “Ali b. Madīnī has strongly disparaged (weakened) him.”

Abū Dāwūd says: “Zayd b. Aslam’s children are all weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

Al-Nasā’ī and Abū Zur‘a have said about ‘Abdul Raḥmān: “He is weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

Abū Ḥātim says: “‘Abdul Raḥmān is not strong in reporting traditions.”

Ibn Ḥibbān comments on ‘Abdul Raḥmān by saying: “Owing to ignorance, he used to narrate the traditions inversely to an extent that he narrated a lot of *mursal* [lit. hurried] traditions as *marfū‘* [attributed] traditions and a lot of the *mawqūf*<sup>2</sup> traditions with chains of transmission and it

---

<sup>1</sup> Cf. *Mizān al-i‘tidāl*, 6/273, *al-Mughni fī al-Ḍu‘afā*, 2/354, *al-Kāshif*, 3/65, *Mir‘āt al-Jinān*, 2/36 in the happenings of the year 207, *al-Ansāb*, 5/567, *Taqrib al-Tahdhīb*, 2/117 and *Ṭabaqāt al-Ḥuffāḍ* (page 81), 149 and other sources.

<sup>2</sup> *Mawqūf* refers to a narration attributed to a Companion, whether a statement of that companion, or an action or otherwise.”

is because of the same reason that his narrations are denounced and disregarded.”

Ibn Sa‘d says: “He has reported a lot of narrations, but surely he is weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

Ibn Khuzaymah says: “‘Abdul Raḥmān is among the people who are of poor memory due to which the scholars and experts never use his narrations to present their argument.”

Sāji says: “His narrations are *munkar* [denounced].”

Tahawī says: “His narrations are weak according to scholars of hadith.”

Jawzjānī says: “Zayd’s children are weak in terms of narrating traditions.”

Hākim and Abū Na‘īm say: “‘Abdul Raḥmān used to narrate forged traditions from his father.”

Ibn al-Jawzī says: “Biographers are unanimous about him being *ḍa‘īf* [weak].”<sup>1</sup>

### **Zayd b. Aslam as Seen by Biographers**

Another narrator of this narration is Zayd b. Aslam. Biographers have written that he has transmitted narrations from Jābir b. ‘Abdullah al-Anṣārī and Abū Hurayra, while Ibn Mu‘īn has said: “Zayd had never heard any narration from either Jābir or Abū Hurayra.”

Thus many narrations reported from other companions have been attributed to him to make the impression that he himself has reported those narrations from them whereas in fact he had never heard them.

Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has also said the same thing about him and Ibn Ḥajar has quoted him and seen eye to eye with him in

---

<sup>1</sup> You can find this matter and other sayings in the book of *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 6/162 and 163.

this regard. He says: “Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has said things in the introduction to his book *al-Tamhīd* which show that Zayd practiced *tadlis* in narrating traditions.”

Moreover, Ibn ‘Umar has been quoted as having said: “I do not know any weaknesses in him other than the fact that he interpreted the Quran based on his own personal opinion and he went to extremes in doing this.”<sup>1</sup>

What was said above ignores the study of the narrators of this tradition between Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr, Ibn Ḥajar and Ibn Wahab.

### **Zubayr b. Bakkār as Seen by Biographers**

Ibn Ḥajar has reported this narration in his *al-Isābah* from Zubayr b. Bakkār. Zubayr was the judge of the city of Makkah and was among the people who went astray by disobeying the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) and the Prophet’s Household (a). With that said about him, he has also been disparaged and reproached by Sunnite scholars. Zubayr died in the year 256 A.H.

It has been reported from Ibn Abī Ḥātim that he saw Zubayr but he did not write any traditions from him.

Aḥmad b. Ali Sulaymānī has mentioned Zubayr b. Bakkār in *al-Ḍu‘afā* (a book on weak and unreliable narrators) and has commented on him as such: “His narrations are denounced.”<sup>2</sup>

In addition, Ibn Ḥajar’s narration from Zubayr has been transmitted by way of *irsāl* (the absence of the link between the successor and the Prophet (s)).

---

<sup>1</sup> You can find these statements and also other sayings in Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb volume 6 pages 162 and 163.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 3/278.

## A Study of the Chains of Transmission of Narrations

What has been mentioned had to do with the main story which was proven, by way of the biographical study, to be baseless. Now we shall review the narrations concerning the marriage of Umm Kulthūm after ‘Umar’s death. Sunni sources have passed on narrations concerning Umm Kulthūm’s life as per which the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) married Umm Kulthūm to ‘Awn b. Ja‘far. The main and original source of this narration is *al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira* which other sources such as *Usd al-Ghabah*, *al-Iṣābah*, *Dhakhair al-Uqba* etc. have cited from.

This narration from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan has been reported through Aḥmad b. ‘Abdul Jabbār, Yūnus b. Bukayr and Ibn Ishāq, from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan. Of course we have already examined the chain of the transmission of this narration.

Al-al-Dūlābī has transmitted this narration with his own chain from Ibn Shahāb al-Zuhrī, who was well-known for his going astray from the path of the Prophet’s household, peace be upon them.<sup>1</sup>

In this study, we have skipped the biographies of other narrators and we are just reminding you of one thing and that is, Ibn Manī‘ – who has narrated from al-Zuhrī – was the brother of Hushām b. ‘Abdul Mālīk’s wife.<sup>2</sup>

### Authenticity of Narrations about Umm Kulthūm’s Death

The narrations which are about Umm Kulthūm’s death have, for the most part, been narrated by Ibn Sa‘d in his *al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*. We shall now examine their chains of transmission and then their significations.

---

<sup>1</sup> Refer to the treatise I have written concerning the narration about Ali’s proposal to Abu Jahl’s daughter.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 7/13.

There is no doubt that most of the chains of the narrators of this narration end to ‘Āmīr al-Sha‘bī. Hence, we shall now explore his personality and try to figure out who he is.

### **A Look at the Biography of ‘Āmīr al-Sha‘bī**

He was born during the last six years of ‘Umar’s reign. He died after the hundredth hegira year. His narrations are, therefore, *mursal* (i.e. the chain of narrators is omitted). Al-Sha‘bī was the judge of the Marwan family.

He was amongst the deviants who opposed the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) to the extent that he went to Ḥajjāj and spoke ill of him (a) and cursed him. al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī was enraged witnessing this. He advised him not to curse Ali (a).<sup>1</sup>

His grudge and enmity impelled him to say: “Ali had never read the Quran nor had he memorized it!” This unconsidered saying made some people oppose him and reject what he had said about Ali (a).<sup>2</sup>

It was because of this enmity that he was led to fabricate narrations such as the following:

- 1- Abū Bakr prayed on Fāṭima, the daughter of Allah’s Prophet (s) and recited four *takbīrs*.
- 2- When Fāṭima passed away, Ali buried her at night and took Abū Bakr by his arm helping him to offer prayer on Fāṭima.

The fact that this narration is fabricated is so obvious that Ibn Ḥajar has been compelled to write under it: “This narration is weak and disconnected.”<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *Iḥyā al-‘Ulūm*, 2/346.

<sup>2</sup> *Ghāyat al-Nihāya fī Ṭabaqāt al-Qurrā’*, 1/541.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Iṣāba*, 8/267.

Likewise, this enmity has made him go as far as to consider Harith al-Hamdānī a liar (because he was Shiite) but he was criticized for having leveled such an accusation against him.

Ibn Ḥajar says in this regard: “While quoting Ibrahim about al-Sha‘bī refuting Harith, Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr writes in his book titled *al-‘Ilm*: “I think al-Sha‘bī should be punished because he has refuted Harith and called him a liar. This is because Harith had not been seen lying, and his only crime was his excessive love of Ali, peace be upon him.”<sup>1</sup>

### A Look at the Biography of ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār

In view of the fact that some of the narrations end with ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār, a quick glimpse into his biographical account reveals that a number of the leaders of ‘Jarh’ – (lit. to injure) and ‘Ta’dil’ – (lit. to adjust)<sup>2</sup> such as Shu‘aba b. Al-Ḥajjāj, Bukhari, Ibn Ḥibbān and others have reproached him.<sup>3</sup>

### A Look at the Biography of Nāfi‘

Some of these narrations are connected to Nāfi‘, the master of Ibn ‘Umar. Hence, we must have a short glimpse of his biography. To understand the type of his character, it is enough to know that ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar had said to Nāfi‘:

“Oh Nāfi‘ fear Allah and do not ascribe lies to me in the same way as ‘Ikrama used to ascribe lies to Ibn ‘Abbās.”

This saying of Ibn ‘Umar about Nāfi‘ and ‘Ikrama, is famous. Additionally, Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal’s saying about Nāfi‘ is

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 2/135.

<sup>2</sup> The phrase *al-jarh wa al-ta’dil* refers to a systematic approach to critiquing a narrator’s position as a narrator.

<sup>3</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 7/341, *Taqrīb al-Tahdhīb*, 1/707.



worthy of notice. He says: “Nāfi’s narrations from ‘Umar are cut-off and disconnected.”<sup>1</sup>

### **A Look at the Biography of ‘Abdullah al-Bahī**

Some of these narrations are connected to ‘Abdullah al-Bahī who is better known as ‘Abdullah b. Yasar.

Concerning him Ibn Hajar says: “‘Abdullah was the master Muṣ‘ab b. Zubayr, therefore, his narrations are ‘*mursal*’ (incompletely transmitted).

Whenever this man narrates from ‘Āisha, he says: “‘Āisha narrated to me.” The scholars have refuted him and said that he narrates only from ‘Urwah b. Zubayr.

Ibn Abī Hātim has also made mention of ‘Abdullah al-Bahī in his *Kitāb al-‘Ilal* reporting from his father that argument cannot be built on al-Bahī’s narrations as they are disordered and shaky.<sup>2</sup>

What has so far been said was about the chains of the transmitters and documentation of the narrations regarding Umm Kulthūm.

Of course, we have, for the sake of brevity, skipped the biographies of other individuals who have transmitted this narration.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 10/370.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, 6/82 and 83.

# 3

## **The Text of the Narrations and Their Significations**

## **The Text of the Narrations and their Significations**

Truth-seeker! Come with me so we may, after we have examined the biographies of the narrators of this story, look into the text of the narrations and their significations. This has to be done so that we should, throughout the stages of the story, look from close the malevolence and spiteful behaviors of the enemies of the household of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon them.

We shall carry on this discussion from several dimensions:

### **First dimension:**

In the concocted story about Umm Kulthūm's marriage to 'Umar, it has been narrated that the reason given by Imam Ali (a) for not consenting to his daughter's marriage to 'Umar was the former's young age and that he had kept her for the son of his brother, Ja'far b. Abī Ṭālib.

It has been narrated in the narration by Ibn Sa'd that Ali (a) said: "I have kept my daughters for the sons of Ja'far."

In the narration of Hākim, the Imam has been quoted as having said: "I have prepared her for the son of my brother."

In another narration quoted by Ibn Sa'd, it is reported that the Imam said: "She is a young girl."

Of course Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Ibn Athīr and others have also reported the same thing. In al-Bayhaqī's narration, it has

been reported that the Imam (a) said: “She is too young (for marriage).”

So in these narrations, nothing else has been reported from the Imam (a), except that ‘Umar returned again and said: “Marry her to me; I swear by Allah! There is no one in this world that....”

According to these narrations, the Imam (a) did not do anything except that he sent her daughter to ‘Umar so that he could see her....!

It has been added in some narration that the Imam (a) ordered her to be prepared and made-up. So she was beautified and adorned and then, the Imam (a) sent her to ‘Umar so that if he liked her and agreed to marry, she would then become his wife!

It is surprising to see how the Imam’s position changes in respect of Umm Kulthūm’s marriage from total and decisive refusal to quick acceptance, thus reversing and changing his mind so quickly?

Who believes this? At least this report is dubious and suspicious and requires some thought and reflection. Certain facts are revealed to the reader who goes through different narrations in this regard, facts that they have attempted to continue to hide in some old works authored by the scholars of hadith. Now we shall mention and elaborate on some of those narrations:

Ibn Maghāzalī (d. 483) narrates through his own chain from ‘Abdullah b. ‘Umar that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb mounted the pulpit and said: “Oh people! I swear by Allah! What made me talk persistently to Alī b. Abī Ṭālib concerning his daughter was the fact that I heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

"كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَنَسَبٍ وَصَهْرٍ مَنْقُطٌ (يوم القيامة) إِلَّا سَبِيَّ وَصَهْرِي، فَانْهَمَا يَأْتِيَانِ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ، يَشْفَعَانِ لِصَاحِبِهِمَا"

*"Every lineage and means and grooming relationship will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and grooming relationship with me, and these two will come on the Day of Judgment and will intercede for their owners."*<sup>2</sup>

Through this narration, it becomes clear that the Companions and their followers were surprised hearing this story and it was even talked about in the city making 'Umar to go on the pulpit and explain to the public his aim of this marriage proposal, and he swore that he had no other reason for this act of his except that he had heard the Messenger of Allah (s) about it and he was bent on doing that only for the same reason.

The point to be taken into consideration is that there is no detail as to 'Umar's persistence and insistence and it has not been explained why he insisted on marrying Ali's daughter and what the latter's reaction was to it.

In Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī's narration, it has been reported that 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb proposed to Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for his daughter, who was from Fāṭima (a), and went to him time and again and said: "O Abal al-Ḥasan, What has made me to come to you time and again is only a saying that I heard from the Messenger of Allah (a) ...."

It has been stated, in this narration, that 'Umar visited Ali (a) many a time.

According to some narrations, 'Umar used threat to intimidate Ali (a) in order to make him accept the offer. For instance, Ibn Sa'd reports: "When Imam Ali (a) told 'Umar that Umm Kulthūm was a young girl, 'Umar said: "I swear

<sup>1</sup> *Manāqib al-Imam Ali ibn Abī Ṭālib (a)*, ibn Maghāzalī, 134 and 135.

<sup>2</sup> *Manāqib al-Imam Ali ibn Abī Ṭālib (a)*, ibn Maghāzalī, 134 & 135.

by Allah! That is not your excuse, but we know what your intention is.”

In the narration reported by al-Dūlābī and Muḥib al-Ṭabarī from Ibn Ishāq, it has been said that ‘Umar said: “I swear by Allah! That is not what you want to do; it is only that you want to stop me from marrying Umm Kulthūm”.<sup>1</sup>

In some other narrations it has been clearly stated that ‘Umar’s whip also played an important role in this incident. In the narration that al-Dūlābī has narrated through his own chain from Aslam, ‘Umar’s master, we read: ‘Umar proposed to Ali b. Abī Ṭālib for his daughter, Umm Kulthūm, and he discussed the matter with ‘Abbās, ‘Aqīl and al-Ḥasan.

‘Aqīl got angry and told Ali: “The passage of days and months will only add to your lack of insight and astuteness in your work. By Allah, if you do this, such and such will happen.”

Ali told ‘Abbās: “By Allah! He is not talking wishfully, but the whip of ‘Umar has impelled him to say what you are hearing”<sup>2</sup>

On the other part, Abū Na‘īm al-Iṣfahānī has also passed this report from Zayd b. Aslam, from his father, but he has omitted “‘Umar’s whip” from the report. Let’s read this narration together:

Zayd b. Aslam narrates from his father that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb called Ali b. Abī Ṭālib to his place and had a private conversation with him. Thereupon, Ali stood up and walked

---

<sup>1</sup> *Dhakhā’ir al-‘Uqba fī Manāqib Dhawī al-Qurba*, 286.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira*, 160.

up to “*sufa*”<sup>1</sup> and consulted ‘Abbās, ‘Aqīl and al-Ḥasan regarding Umm Kulthūm’s marriage to ‘Umar.

Ali Said: “‘Umar has informed me that he heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مُنْقَطِعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*‘Every means and lineage is severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and means.’*<sup>2</sup>

Apart from being an underage girl and the fact that Umm Kulthūm had been kept for the son of Ja‘far, Ali (a) also gave another reason for his refusal where the Imam (a) said: “She has also two other guardians apart from me.”<sup>3</sup>

What the Imam (a) meant by those two were Imam al-Ḥasan and Imam al-Ḥusayn (a). According to the narrations, Ali discussed the matter with al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn (a), ‘Aqīl and ‘Abbās.

This narration that has been reported from Aslam implies that Imam al-Ḥasan (a) kept silent about this proposal, and his silence has been taken as a sign of his consent and approval.

In another narration it is reported that al-Ḥusayn kept quiet and al-Ḥasan started to talk. Thanking and praising Allah he said: “Dear father, apart from ‘Umar, who else is more appropriate for marriage with Umm Kulthūm? He was a companion of the Prophet of Allah (s) and when the Prophet (s) passed away, he was pleased with him. He has taken the caliphate and has acted justly!

<sup>1</sup> A raised place with a roof made of leaves of date-palm trees and it is a resting place for the poor and miserable.

<sup>2</sup> *Ḥilyat al-Awliyā’*, 2/42.

<sup>3</sup> *Dhakhā’ir al-‘Uqba*, 289.

Ali said: “You are right, my son, but I did not want to finish a task without seeking the opinion of you two.”<sup>1</sup>

This narration contradicts the narration that al-Bayhaqī has reported from Ibn Abī Malikah, from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan. It is reported in that narration that Ali told al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn: “Marry her to your uncle.”

They said: “She is also like all other women and has the right to choose.” Thereupon, Ali stood up angrily but al-Ḥasan grabbed his cloth and said: “Dear father, we cannot tolerate missing you.”

Ali said: “Then marry her to ‘Umar.”<sup>2</sup>

Nevertheless, a group of people have intentionally and knowingly paid heed to these forged narrations. Now, you should give careful attention to the narrations. This same contradiction has been reported from al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥasan in connection with the marriage of Umm Kulthūm with ‘Awn b. Ja‘far. In that narration, it is reported that when Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib became a widow after the death of ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, her brothers al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn, came over to her and said....<sup>3</sup>

This is a long narration that contains shameful lies and laughable statements.

### **Second dimension:**

It has been stated before that as per many narrations the reason Imam Ali (a) opposed to Umm Kulthūm's marriage to ‘Umar was the fact that she was young and underage. It is inferred from these narrations that ‘Umar did not accept what Ali (a) put forth as an excuse. That was why he went to Ali time and again asking him persistently for his daughter's

---

<sup>1</sup> *Dhakhā'ir al-‘Uqba* 289.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Sunan al- Kubra*, 7/185 number 13660.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira*, 162 and 163; *Dhakhā'ir al-‘Uqba* 290.



hand in marriage. He went as far as to use threat to intimidate Ali (a) to accept the proposal as evidenced by narrations reported by al-Dūlābī and Muḥib al-Ṭabarī.

Ali said: "She is young."

ʿUmar said: "I swear by Allah! That is not what you want to do; it is only that you want to stop me from marrying Umm Kulthūm. If what you say is the case, send her to me..."<sup>1</sup>

Since such actions are not in keeping with the reverence and respect of the second caliph according to Sunni scholars, some narrators and hadith experts have avoided to report on the opposition of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) to his daughter's marriage to ʿUmar and also the latter's insistence, threat and refutation. One who refers to Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī's narration will readily admit this fact.

### **Third dimension:**

Ibn Saʿd narrates from al-Wāqidī and others and says: "Then Ali requested for a piece of garment which he folded and told Umm Kulthūm to take it to ʿUmar.

It has been stated in Muḥib al-Ṭabarī's report from Ibn Ishāq that Ali called Umm Kulthūm, gave her a piece of cloth and told her: "Take this to ʿUmar..."

This was done to make ʿUmar see her. That was why when Umm Kulthūm returned to her father, she said: "ʿUmar did not unfold the cloth and he did not look at anything except me."

Surely, such a behavior from the Muslim's caliph has been seen by some Sunni scholars e.g. Sabṭ b. al-Jawzī, as filthy and unpleasant. We shall soon point out his words in this regard. It is for the same reason that some narrators have not made reference to this topic in their narrations.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Dhurriyat al-Ṭāhira*, 157 and 158; *Dhakhā'ir al-ʿUqba*, 286.

Abū Bushr al-Dūlābī has narrated as such: “Ali called Umm Kulthūm, who was a little girl, and said to her: “Go to Amīr al-Mu’minīn and tell him: “My father sent you his greetings and said that he fulfilled the request that you had made.”

Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī has also reported a similar narration:

“‘Umar proposed to Ali for his daughter’s hand in marriage and said: “Marry her to me.”

Ali said: “I have kept her for the son of my brother, ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far.”

‘Umar said: “I swear by Allah, there is no man on the face of the earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.”

Thereupon, Ali married her to ‘Umar and the latter went to the Muhājirīn.”

#### **Fourth dimension:**

In this story, filthy and unpalatable things have been quoted including the following:

Ibn Sa‘d narrates from Ibn al-Wāqīdī as such: “Ali ordered Umm Kulthūm to be made up and adorned so that she could go to ‘Umar. She was prepared and adorned (as ordered by her father).”

In the narration transmitted by Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī from ‘Uqba b. ‘Āmir, it has been reported: “She was adorned.”

In the narration reported from Imam al-Bāqir (a) by Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr and others, the Imam has been quoted as having said: “When Umm Kulthūm went to ‘Umar, ‘Umar pulled the cloth away from her calf!”

Truly, these reports are at the highest level of obscenity. The question is that, are the liars and forgers of these narrations not ashamed of doing such obscene and loathsome acts?

Their conducts are so mean and despicable that even if a lay person hears them, he will readily despise them and testify to their obscenity. Are they not ashamed of forging and attributing such filthy stories to Imam al-Bāqir, peace be upon him?

Indeed it is so shameless and it is owing to the same reason that we see some Sunni narrators trying to misreport and concoct such stories in order to prove their side of the story. Ibn Athīr modifies the story and makes it look a bit modest. He says: “‘Umar placed his hand on her.”

In this respect, al-Dūlābī and Muḥib al-Ṭabarī have reported as such: “‘Umar took hold of her arm.”

Else where they say: “‘Umar grabbed her and pulled her to his bosom!”

Others such as al-Bayhaqī and Hākim al-Nīshābūrī have not narrated anything in this regard. When reporting such narrations, Muḥib al-Ṭabarī says: “Ibn Samman has made a brief but implicit reference to this subject.” However, what he has reported does not include anything from the reports transmitted by the narrators whose names were mentioned above.<sup>1</sup>

In addition, some of the narrators of this story, have stated clearly that this story is a lie. Concerning this same issue, Sabṭ b. al-Jawzī (d. 654) says: “My grandfather writes in *al-Muntaẓam* that Ali sent Umm Kulthūm to ‘Umar so that he could see her. ‘Umar pulled the cloth away from her calf and then touched her!”

---

<sup>1</sup> Refer to: *Dhakhā'ir al-'Uqba*, 289.

Sabṭ b. al-Jawzī further says: “In my opinion – I swear by Allah – this is a despicable act; even if she were a slave girl, she would not have been treated as such.”<sup>1</sup>

On the other hand, Muslims are unanimous about touching a non-mahram lady being prohibited in Islam. The question is: Why are they attributing all this to ‘Umar? <sup>2</sup>

The author says: “I wish it were only touching.” In Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī’s narration, ‘Umar is said to have even kissed and grabbed the calf of Umm Kulthūm’s leg!

### **Fifth dimension:**

The text of the narration narrated by Ibn Sa’d and others, in a way, contains praise and congratulation. We have read that ‘Umar told Meccan migrants: “Congratulate me.” and they congratulated him.<sup>3</sup> In other words, ‘Umar requested a special congratulation and said: “Congratulate me on wives’ being considerate and empathetic and on having more children.”<sup>4</sup>

It is pretty obvious that this kind of congratulation was customary in the period of ignorance which, according to all Muslims, the Messenger of Allah (s) had prohibited. In this regard, Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal narrates through his own chain that

---

<sup>1</sup> It is worth mentioning that in the Islamic laws (of both the Sunni and Shī‘a sects) specific laws on how to treat a slave have been discussed which are not comparable with the laws regarding a free woman. In any case, the meanness and obscenity of Umar’s action remains in place and what Ibn al-Jawzī al-Ḥanafī means from the above statement refers to the very point.

<sup>2</sup> *Tadhkirat al-Khawāṣ*, 288 and 289.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Ṭabaqat al-Kubra*, 8/339, *Kanzul Ummal*, 13/269 number 37576, *al-Isti‘ab*, 4/509, *Usd al-Ghābah*, 7/378, *al-Iṣābah*, 8/465.

<sup>4</sup> *Dhakhā‘ir al-‘Uqba*, 287. To understand the meaning of this kind of congratulation, refer to ‘*Lisan al-Arab*’ and other books in Arabic grammar to find the word “Rifā’a”.

‘Abdullah b. Muḥammad b. ‘Aqīl says: “‘Aqīl son of Ṭālib had married, he came to us and we congratulated him in the way which was customary during the period of ignorance. ‘Aqīl said: “Calm down! Do not congratulate me in such a manner because the Prophet of Allah (s) prohibited us from congratulating in such a manner and he said: “You should say “May Allah bless you, may Allah make it blessed, may it be blessed.”<sup>1</sup>

Since this statement of ‘Umar depicts his ignorance and a lack of knowledge about the things that the Messenger of Allah (s) prohibited as well as indicates the fact that he wanted to revive the customs and norms of the period of ignorance, some Sunni scholars have endeavored to alter the text and manipulate it in a way which is consistent with their own values and standards. That is why in Hākim’s *al-Mustadrak*, we read: “‘Umar went to the Muhājirīn and said: “Will you not congratulate me?”

In al-Bayhaqī’s *al-Sunan al-Kubra*, it is reported that ‘Umar went to the Muhājirīn and they prayed and wished him well. Let’s not forget that Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī has never narrated this incident in his *Tārīkh* (history book).

### **Sixth dimension:**

Another aspect of this story that can be studied and examined is the fruit of this false marriage; it has been reported in some narrations that following the marriage of Umm Kulthūm to Ummar, she gave birth to a son allegedly named Zayd. It has been reported by Sa‘d and other narrators that she gave birth to Ibn ‘Umar and Ruqayyah, daughter of ‘Umar.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Musnad Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal*, 4/484. Refer to *Wasā’il al-Shī’a*, 14/183 tradition number 25550.

When it comes to the number of 'Umar's children, al-Nawawī narrates as such: "Fāṭima and Zayd whose mother was Umm Kulthūm..."<sup>1</sup>

In another narration passed on by Ibn Qutayba about the daughters of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him, it has been stated as such: "Umm Kulthūm gave birth to children whose name we mentioned."<sup>2</sup>

### **Seventh dimension:**

One of the topics discussible in this fabricated story is Umm Kulthūm's marriage after 'Umar; it has been mentioned in many a number of narrations that after 'Umar's death, 'Awn followed by Muḥammad sons of Ja'far married Umm Kulthūm but the same people who have reported that these two married Umm Kulthūm have said: "'Awn and Muḥammad were killed in the battle of Shushtar which took place during 'Umar's caliphate."

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr says: "'Awn son of Ja'far b. Abī Ṭālib was born in the time of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants. 'Awn's mother and that of his brothers 'Abdullah and Muḥammad sons of Ja'far b. Abī Ṭālib was Asma daughter of 'Umays Khath'amī. 'Awn and his brother, Muḥammad, were martyred in the battle of Shushtar without leaving any children behind."<sup>3</sup>

He further says: Muḥammad b. Ja'far b. Abī Ṭālib was born in the time of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants. He is the one who, after the death of 'Umar

---

<sup>1</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Asmā wa al-Lughāt*, 2/334.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Ma'ārif*, 122.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Isṭī'āb*, 3/315.

b. al-Khaṭṭāb, married Umm Kulthūm, daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib... and was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.<sup>1</sup>

Concerning ‘Awn b. Ja‘far's martyrdom, Ibn Ḥajar says, "‘Awn b. Ja‘far was martyred in the battle of Shushtar which took place in the time of ‘Umar's caliphate. He did not have a child."<sup>2</sup>

Ibn Athīr has made a similar comment.<sup>3</sup>

It is pertinent to mention that the battle took place during the caliphate of ‘Umar and historians have made clear reference to it in their accounts.<sup>4</sup>

In this passage quoted from Ibn Ḥajar, he has made mention of the same fact. Indeed, a truth-seeking researcher is amazedly mindful of the contradictory reports and narrations transmitted by these people.

### **Eighth dimension:**

An important question in connection with the topic under discussion is: Which one of the two brothers married Umm Kulthūm, ‘Awn b. Ja‘far or Muḥammad b. Ja‘far? Sunni traditions provide different accounts in this regard. Ibn Sa‘d and Dār Qutnī, as stated in al-Iṣābah, says: "‘Awn died during the lifetime of Umm Kulthūm and his brother, Muḥammad, contracted marriage with her. Then, Muḥammad died and ‘Abdullah married her."

Ibn Sa‘d narrates as such: Umm Kulthūm said: "I feel embarrassed towards Asmā bint ‘Umays whose two sons died when they were with me, and I am worried about the

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Istī‘āb*, 3/423 and 424.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Iṣābah*, 4, 4/ 619.

<sup>3</sup> *Usd al-Ghābah*, 4, 302.

<sup>4</sup> *Tārīkh Tabari*, 3/ 174, al-Kāmil fī al-Tārīkh, 2/550.

third one!” Umm Kulthūm died when she was with ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far.”<sup>1</sup>

Ibn Qutayba narrates this story differently; he says: “When ‘Umar was killed, Muḥammad b. Ja‘far married Umm Kulthūm and died during her lifetime. Then ‘Awn b. Ja‘far married her and Umm Kulthūm died when she was married to him.”<sup>2</sup>

You can see that Ibn Qutayba has mentioned the marriage of Muḥammad b. Ja‘far to Umm Kulthūm before the latter’s marriage to ‘Awn b. Ja‘far. As stated, she died when she was still married to ‘Awn. Qutayba has made no mention of ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far.

Moreover, although Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has discussed Umm Kulthūm’s life, he has not stated anything regarding her marriage after ‘Umar’s death, nor has he said anything about her marriage to ‘Awn. Nevertheless, when it comes to Muḥammad b. Ja‘far’s life, he says: “Muḥammad b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib is the one who married Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib, after the death of ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb.”<sup>3</sup>

### **Ninth dimension:**

In this section, we shall now have a short look at the biography of ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far. He was the husband of the Wise Woman of Bani Hashim, e.g. Zaynab, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a). Lady Zaynab (a) used to live with her husband ‘Abdullah until his death after the tragedy of Karbala.

Concerning Zaynab (a), Ibn Sa‘d writes: “Zaynab was the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib. ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra*: 8/338.

<sup>2</sup> *Al Ma‘ārif*, 122.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Istī‘āb*, 3/424.



married her. They were blessed with four sons namely; Ali, ‘Awn Akbar, ‘Abbās and Muḥammad and a daughter named Umm Kulthūm.”

Ibn Sa’d goes on to report a narration from Muḥammad b. Ismā‘īl b. Fadik, he from Ibn Abī Zi’b that he said: “‘Abdul Raḥmān b. Mahrān told me as such: “‘‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib married Zaynab the daughter of Ali. At the same time he had married Ali’s widow, Laylā Bint Mas‘ūd; both Zaynab and Laylā were his wives.”<sup>1</sup>

After counting the number of ‘Abdullah’s children, al-Nawavī says: “Their mother was Zaynab, the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib from Fāṭima, the daughter of the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.”<sup>2</sup>

Concerning Hazrat Zaynab (a), Ibn Ḥajar writes: “Zaynab was the daughter of Ali b. Abī Ṭālib b. ‘Abdul Muṭṭalib. She was Hāshimī and the granddaughter of the Messenger of Allah (s) and her mother was Fāṭima.”

He further writes: “Ibn Athīr describes Zaynab as such: “She was born during the lifetime of the Messenger of Allah (s). She was an intelligent and a learned woman as well as a great orator. Her father married her to the son of his brother, ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far whereupon they were blessed with children. When her brother Imam al-Ḥusayn (a) was killed, she was in his company but then she was taken to Shām (Syria). She was present in the court of Yazid son of Mu‘āwiyya. While in the court, a man from Shām wanted to take her sister Fāṭima as a slave. Addressing Yazid, Zaynab delivered a speech that showed her intelligence and strong heart. This story is well-known.”<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*, 8/340.

<sup>2</sup> *Tahdhīb al-Asmā’*, wa *al-Lughāt*, 1/249.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Iṣābah*, 8/166 and 167.

Therefore, if the woman who was called Umm Kulthūm and who died during the reign of Mu‘āwīyya is the very daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) and she was ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far’s wife after the death of ‘Awn and Muḥammad (as also reported in the narrations), then it implies that ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far married two sisters at the same time, something which is prohibited and obscene in Islam.

That is why Ibn Sa‘d has carefully reported saying: “Umm Kulthūm was married to Muḥammad b. Ja‘far. After his death, his brother ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far b. Abī Ṭālib married her following the death of her sister, Zaynab.”

### **Tenth dimension:**

Another question that comes up is, who prayed on Umm Kulthūm after she died? The answer to this question is found in the reported narrations, but there are contradictions and discrepancies in those reports. The contradictions are found even in the narrations reported by one narrator.

When it comes to the prayer on Umm Kulthūm and her son Zayd, Ibn Sa‘d narrates from Shu‘abī and ‘Abdullah al-Baḥī as such: “Ibn ‘Umar prayed on them.”

He has also reported the same story from ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār and Nāfi‘ who said: “Sa‘īd b. ‘Ās prayed on them.”

It is interesting to note that some historiographers have narrated from ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār that Sa‘d b. Abī Waqqāṣ prayed on them.<sup>1</sup>

In any case, regardless of who offered the funeral prayer, the narrations indicate the fact that she died during the reign of Mu‘āwīyya because the narrations report that Imam al-Ḥasan and Imam al-Ḥusayn (a) attended the prayer.

<sup>1</sup> *Tārīkh al-Khamīs*, 2/285.

However, what is proven through historical accounts is that Umm Kulthūm and her sister Zaynab (a) were present in the event of Karbala. When they were taken to Kūfā as slaves, she delivered a famous speech in that city the text of which has been recorded and narrated in many books.

Ibn Tayfūr (d. 280) has narrated Umm Kulthūm's speech in the book of *Balāghāt al-Nisā*. Ibn Athīr and a few other famous scholars and traditionists have also mentioned it under the term '*farth*' in their books such as *al-Nihāya*, *Lisān al-'Arab* and *Tāj al-'Arūs*.

Perhaps it is because of the same reason that in Abū Dāwūd's narration from 'Ammār b. Abī 'Ammār, it is reported that 'Ammār b. Abī 'Ammār said: "I was present in the funeral prayer on Umm Kulthūm and her son. Her son's corpse was placed on the side where the Imam was standing to which I objected but Ibn 'Abbās, Abū Sa'īd al-Khudrī, Abū Qutāda and Abū Hurayra were also in attendance. They said that the way they placed the corpses in front of the prayer leader was customary."<sup>1</sup>

'Ammār b. Abī 'Ammār ends the story without mentioning the name of the Imam who prayed on those two. Likewise, he has not clarified as to who Umm Kulthūm and her son were.

It has been reported again in Al-Nasā'ī's narrations from 'Ammār b. Abī 'Ammār that he said: "I was attending the funeral prayer of a lady and a son. The corpse of the son was placed in front on the side at which the Imam was standing and that of the lady was placed behind him when the prayer on those two was offered. Among the people in attendance were Abū Sa'īd, Ibn 'Abbās, Qutāda and Abū Hurayra. I

---

<sup>1</sup> *Sunan Abi Dawud*, 2/416 number 3193.

objected to the way they had positioned the corpses and they said that it was customary.”<sup>1</sup>

Here ‘Ammār b. Abī ‘Ammār has only reported that tradition and he has failed to mention the Imam's name, and those of the two dead bodies on which prayer was offered nor has he stated anything about the relation between the woman and the boy.

### Summary

As you noticed, we presented and examined the chains of the transmission of the narrations about the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) marrying his daughter to ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, and other narrations pertaining to this great lady of the Household of the Prophet (s). However, we could not find in them a chain of transmission that could be relied upon or which an argument could be based upon. We also investigated meticulously the text of the narration regarding Umm Kulthūm’s marriage to ‘Umar. We looked carefully into the sayings of Sunni scholars and their reports on this topic. We found out their reports contradictory and conflicting.

Moreover, we also studied the significations of the narration and it was made clear that the entire story is baseless and undocumented. The probability here is that the forgers of this story sought to create a virtue for ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb who himself is one of the narrators of this prophetic tradition:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مُنْقَطِعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*‘Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.’*

---

<sup>1</sup> *Sunan al-Al-Nīsā* ʿī, 4/374 number 1976.

This tradition signifies the virtues and merits of the Prophet's Household especially the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a). As also stated by al-Manawī, even Hākim al-Nīshābūrī has narrated the above tradition as a proof of the virtues of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a).<sup>1</sup> That was why they forged the story of 'Umar's proposal to the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) in a bid to include 'Umar amongst those who were linked to the Prophet (s) and to finally establish a virtue for him. This is further evidenced by the fact that a number of great Sunni traditionists have reported this tradition from 'Umar without mentioning this story, and they have reported the same tradition from other individuals without making reference to 'Umar's marriage proposal and the relevant story.

Muttaqi Hindi has cited this tradition from different sources. As per his report, the Messenger of Allah (a) said:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مَنقُطَعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.'*

However, he writes under the tradition as such: "Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī and Hākim al-Nīshābūrī have narrated this tradition from 'Umar. Likewise, Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī has narrated from Ibn 'Abbās and Miswar." He further says that Ibn Asākir has also narrated from Ibn 'Umar that the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants, said:

«كُلُّ نَسَبٍ وَ صَهْرٍ يَنْقُطَعُ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا نَسَبِي وَ صَهْرِي»

*Every lineage and grooming relation will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and grooming relation.'*<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Faidh al-Qadir*, 5/27.

<sup>2</sup> *Kanzul 'Ummāl*, 11/183 number 31911 & 31912.

Ibn Maghāzalī has reported this tradition in *Manāqib al-Imam Ali b. Abī Ṭālib* (a) that the Prophet of Allah (s) said:

«كُلُّ سَبَبٍ وَ نَسَبٍ مُنْقَطِعٌ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ إِلَّا سَبَبِي وَ نَسَبِي»

*Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.*<sup>1</sup>

Then he narrates this tradition through his own chain from Sa'īd b. Jubayr, from Ibn 'Abbās, from 'Umar.<sup>1</sup>

There is a narration similar to this one reported from the Holy Prophet (s) about Fāṭima's position and rank. He has been quoted as having said:

«فاطمة بضعة مني»

*"Fāṭima is a part of my body..."*

The Holy Prophet (s) has been quoted by different companions to have said the above on a number of occasions. When some enemies of the Prophet's Household (a) saw the different aspects and implications of this sound and authentic tradition which has been recorded in their own *Siḥāḥ*, they deliberately embarked on fabricating the story of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) making a marriage proposal to Abū Jahl's daughter, something which they linked to the above tradition to prove their own side of the story.<sup>2</sup> Thus, both of the traditions relate to marriage proposals, one of them about 'Umar asking the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) for her hand in marriage and the other is about Ali (a) proposing marriage to Abū Jahl's daughter!

'Umar's marriage to Umm Kulthūm would make him a groom of Fāṭima Zahrā (a) while Ali's marriage to Abū Jahl's daughter would hurt Fāṭima and injure her feeling! As

<sup>1</sup> *Manāqib al-Imam Ali ibn Abī Ṭālib* (a), 133 & 134.

<sup>2</sup> Refer to the treatises that we have written in this regard.

stated earlier, 'Umar's proposal was owing to the fact that he had heard the Prophet of Allah (s) say:

«كلّ سبب و نسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي و نسبي»

*'Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.'*

Ali's proposal was opposed by the Messenger of Allah (s) and he was offended to the extent that he, peace be upon him, wanted Ali to divorce his daughter!

In short, given the outcome of the research conducted into this story, it is very clear that the entire story is fabricated and outrageous.

When it comes to the narrators of this story, they are 'Umar's slave, Qāḍi b. Zubayr, the killer of 'Ammār Yasir and the clerics who were affiliated to the Ummayyad family.

The narrators in the chain of the narrators are a few liars, fabricators, weak and *mudallis* (one who practices *tadlis*).

Most probably, the main reason for fabricating this story is what we just mentioned as evidenced by the fact that some of the narrators are involved in the transmission of both of the stories.

### **One Question**

Based on what was said, assuming the authenticity and the reliability of the chains of the narrators of the narrations, a question arises as to whether or not there is any probability or an occasion to which the narrations regarding this story could be applied notwithstanding the fact that this story is famous among Sunni Muslims and there are few *shādh* (irregular) narrations reported in this connection through Shiite channels as well.

### Answer

In reply to this question, we must say that there is no doubt that the statements and narrations reported in this regard contain allegations and claims which are unacceptable under any circumstances.” For instance, go through the following narration that they have related: “Ali sent Umm Kulthūm to ‘Umar so that he could see her. He also ordered that she be adorned and beautified!” There are many other such narrations which we do not mention here for the sake of brevity.

Obviously the reason these narrations are invalid and false is quite clear. Another instance is the story of the death of Umm Kulthūm during the time of Mu‘āwiyya as reported by Sunni narrators. The report that she died during Mu‘āwiyya’s reign is untrue because she was present in the event of Karbala and there are reports confirming her presence in the incidents that took place on the Day of Ashura.

Therefore, that lady who died on the same day as Zayd, and on whom a certain individual prayed was one of ‘Umar’s wives with her name being either Umm Kulthūm (as she had wives whose names or nicknames were Umm Kulthūm) or she was someone bearing a name other than Umm Kulthūm.<sup>1</sup>

Assuming the authenticity of their narrations and their *isnād* [chains of transmission], this probability is reaffirmed by the narrations of Abū Dāwūd, Al-Nasā’ī and others. Thus, there is no reliable report to prove that Umm Kulthūm, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) bore ‘Umar a child called Zayd. That is because there is no evidence apart from the narrations that were proved to be worthless and fabricated.

Likewise, there is no report or evidence to prove that she gave birth to a daughter, not to mention the fact that the

---

<sup>1</sup> *Ifham al-A’adā Wa al- Khusum*, 2/72 – 212.



narrators themselves have discrepant views as to the story itself as well as the name of that daughter.

It is further reaffirmed by Muslim scholars who have said: "When 'Umar died, Umm Kulthūm was still young and immature." One of those scholars is Shaykh Abū Muḥammad al-Nawbakhtī who is one of the early Shiite scholars. In his *al-Imāma*, he writes: "Umm Kulthūm was young and juvenile and 'Umar died before consummating marriage with her."<sup>1</sup>

Likewise, Shaykh Abū 'Abdullah Muḥammad b. 'Abdul Bāqī al-Zarqānī al-Mālikī (d.1122 - <sup>2</sup>) while elaborating on the meaning of kinship of the holy Prophet (s) makes reference to the same point saying: "Kinship refers to people who are related to the closest grandfather of the Messenger of Allah (s) i.e. 'Abdul Muṭṭalib because the Prophet (s) said:

«من صنع الى احد من ولد عبد المطلب يدا فلم يكافئه بها في الدنيا، فعلي مكافاته اذا لقيتني»

*"Whoever treats well any of the children of 'Abdul Muṭṭalib and does him a favor and he does not make up for the favor in this world, it will be necessary upon me to make it up on the Day of Judgment when he shall meet me."*

Al-Ṭabāranī has reported this tradition in *al-Mu'jam al-Awsaṭ*. Hence, those who are related to people before 'Abdul Muṭṭalib like the children of 'Abdul Manāf, or the people who are in the same level related to 'Abdul Manāf, for example the children of Hāshim, the brothers of 'Abdul Muṭṭalib or the people related to him but who did not see him or associated with him, are excluded from his kinship.

<sup>1</sup> *Bihār al-anwār*, 42/91.

<sup>2</sup> His biography can be read in *Silk al- Durar fī A'ayān al- Qarn al-Thānī 'Ashar*, 4/32

It seems that kinship does not refer to the men and women who were in the company of the Messenger of Allah (s) and did not see him; but it refers to Ali and his children; al-Ḥasan, al-Ḥusayn, Moḥassin and Umm Kulthūm, the wife of the second caliph, ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb.

In fact, ‘Umar died before Umm Kulthūm reached the age of puberty and ‘Awn b. Ja‘far married her. He also departed and she got married to his brother, Muḥammad. He too died and she got married to ‘Abdullah, the brother of those two. Umm Kulthūm died in his house and did not bear a child with any of those three, except Muḥammad, for whom she bore a daughter who died, while still a child. Thus, Umm Kulthūm does not have any children or descendents as the author mentioned in the second section of this book.<sup>1</sup>

Furthermore, assuming that ‘Umar married Umm Kulthūm, the fact that Umm Kulthūm did not bear a child is reaffirmed by ‘Umar who stressed that he did not want anything by making a marriage proposal but to be the son-in-law of the Holy Prophet (s). He insisted that he wanted to be one of the members of the Prophet’s household (a). He declared that he did not seek to gain anything except relationship with the Messenger of Allah through marriage with Umm Kulthūm.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Sharḥ al-Mawāhib al-Ladūniyya*, 7/9 and 10, theme: Mabḥath Qarābat al-Nabī (s).

# 4

## ‘Umar’s Marriage to Umm Kulthūm in Shiite Narrations

## **‘Umar’s Marriage to Umm Kulthūm in Shiite Narrations<sup>1</sup>**

As was mentioned while raising a question regarding Umm Kulthūm’s marriage to ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, the story is famous and well-known among Sunni Muslims and the narrations regarding this marriage have also been reported in the books authored by Shia scholars. However, in spite of this story being well-known among Sunni Muslims and the fact that it has also been reported in some Shiite sources, some of our scholars have rejected the story on the ground that it is not true and genuine. If one goes through Shiite sources, he will see the rejection and refutation in the works authored by Shaykh al-Mufīd, al-Sayyid Murtaḍa and al-Sayyid Nāṣir Ḥusayn, the son of the author of *‘Abaqāt al-Anwār* (may Allah bless him) – and in the works by other figures who have critically assessed this very subject matter.

Here we reiterate that the narrations reported by reliable Shiite narrators indicate and reveal what we have already stated in our answer to the forgoing question. In this respect, we quoted al-Nawbakhtī, one of the Shiite scholars, and also

---

<sup>1</sup> It is worth mentioning that the previous edition of this book lacked this section as it was added only in the wake of a request by some scholars and seminarians. That was because my study was focused only on Sunni traditions and narrations in connection with the subject matter. It is expected that this section will be supplementary and that it will throw further light on the answers given briefly in this book.

al-Zarqānī, a Sunnite scholar. Now we shall mention and elaborate on the narrations reported by Shiite sources through reliable chains of transmission.<sup>1</sup>

### **The first tradition:**

Imam Ja‘far al-Šādiq (a) has been reported as having said concerning the marriage of Umm Kulthūm:

«إِنَّ ذَلِكَ فَرجَ غصبناه»

*“That this was the farj that was usurped from us.”*

### **The second tradition:**

It has been narrated in another narration that Imam al-Šādiq (a) said:

«لَمَّا خَطَبَ إِلَيْهِ قَالَ لَهُ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: أَتَاهَا صَبِيَّةٌ.

قَالَ: فَلَقِيَ الْعَبَّاسَ فَقَالَ لَهُ: مَا لِي؟ أَبِي بَاسٌ؟

قَالَ: وَمَا ذَاكَ؟

قَالَ: خَطَبْتُ إِلَى ابْنِ أَخِيكَ فَرَدَنِي، أَمَا وَاللَّهِ! لَأَعُورٌ زَمَزَمَ، وَلَا أَدَعُ لَكُمْ مَكْرَمَةَ إِلَّا

هَدَمْتُهَا، وَلَا قِيمَتَ عَلَيْهِ شَاهِدِينَ بَأَنَّهُ سَرَقَ، وَلَا قِطْعَنَ يَمِينِهِ.

فَاتَهُ الْعَبَّاسُ وَسَالَهُ أَنْ يَجْعَلَ الْأَمْرَ إِلَيْهِ. فَجَعَلَهُ إِلَيْهِ»<sup>2</sup>

“When ‘Umar came to make the marriage proposal, the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) told him: “She is a young girl.”

Thereupon, ‘Umar met ‘Abbās and told him: “What is wrong with me? Do I have any defect?”

‘Abbās said: “Why are you saying that?”

<sup>1</sup> Of course in this topic there are other traditions in the sources of the Shī‘a which after a careful evaluation, we have realized that on the part of their documents, they have been tampered with and disclaimed.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Kāfī*, 5/346 tradition number 1 and 2.

‘Umar said: “I asked your nephew for his daughter’s hand in marriage, but he has turned me down. I swear by Allah! I will fill the well of Zamzam with earth, I will destroy every honor that you have, and I will set up two witnesses to testify that he stole, that I may cut off his right hand.” ‘Abbās thereupon came to Ali and informed him of what had transpired. He asked Ali to put the matter in his hands, and Ali complied.”

### **The third tradition:**

In another narration reported from Sulaymān b. Khālīd and others, Sulaymān has been quoted as having said: “I asked Imam al-Ṣādiq (a) as to where a lady whose husband had died should pass her ‘Idda (waiting) period<sup>1</sup>. Was it necessary for her to pass the period in her husband's house or wherever she wanted?”

The Imam (a) said: “Yes, she can pass her waiting period wherever she would like to.” Then he said:

“إِنَّ عَلِيًّا عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ لَمَّا مَاتَ عَمْرَاتِي أُمَّ كَلْثُومٍ فَاخَذَ بِيَدِهَا، فَانْطَلَقَ بِهَا إِلَى بَيْتِهِ”

*“When ‘Umar died, Ali (a) went to Umm Kulthūm, got hold of her hand and brought her to his house.”*

In view of the above details and assuming that the narrations are true and authentic, we say: “The opponents cannot use these narrations to base their arguments and prove their side of the story or to make us accept anything in this regard. This is because the ultimate conclusion that can be drawn from these narrations is that the marriage contract took place under threat and intimidating promises. It was only after these threats that Umm Kulthūm went to ‘Umar’s house. When

<sup>1</sup> ‘Idda is a waiting period of (four months and ten days) during which a lady who has lost her husband, must stay away from marriage.

<sup>2</sup> *Al-Kāfī*, 6/115 and 116 tradition number 2, this information because of its application in the aforesaid law, it has also been mentioned in the books of Islamic laws.

‘Umar was killed, the Imam (a) went to Umm Kulthūm and took her to his house.

On the other hand, perhaps this saying of Imam Ja‘far al-Šādiq (a) i.e. “Ali (a) held her hand and took her to his house” is a proof of what some scholars have stated that ‘Umar died before Umm Kulthūm attained the age of puberty.

Therefore, what merit do this proposal and the imposed marriage which was characterized by threat and intimidation earn ‘Umar? What defect and flaw does such a proposal or marriage exact on the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) and the Household of the Prophet, peace be upon them? Can such a marriage be an indication of the two sides being sincere friends of each other?

When ‘Umar threatens the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a), in the manner demonstrated by the narrations, to usurp and get this girl, how may his threats have been for usurping the caliphate which forcibly silenced the Commander of the Faithful (a) and his followers compelling them to pay allegiance to him?! In fact, we can say that this usurpation was meant to eliminate the effects of that usurpation.

Indeed, Al-Ḥajjāj b. Yusuf al-Thaqafī learnt this same method from ‘Umar as evidenced by this historical narration: Muḥammad b. Idris al-Shafī‘ī (d. 204) says: “When Al-Ḥajjāj b. Yusuf married the daughter of ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far, Khālīd b. Yazīd b. Mu‘āwīyya told ‘Abdul Mālīk b. Marwān: “Did you leave Al-Ḥajjāj to marry the daughter of ‘Abdullah b. Ja‘far?”

He said: “Yes, what is wrong with it?”

Khālīd said: “By Allah, this is the worst shame.”

‘Abdul Mālīk asked: “How is that?”

Khālīd said: “I swear by Allah! O Commander of the Faithful, ever since I married Ramlah, the daughter of

Zubayr, the enmity I had in my heart toward Zubayr, has perished.” Khālīd goes on saying: “It seems ‘Abdul Mālīk was asleep and I woke him up with these words of mine. Then and there he wrote a letter to Al-Ḥajjāj making him to divorce ‘Abdullah’s daughter.” Al-Ḥajjāj complied with ‘Abdul Mālīk’s order and divorced her.<sup>1</sup>

### Final Word Concerning the Marriage of Umm Kulthūm

Considering the investigation and research conducted in regard to Umm Kulthūm's marriage, a question that does arise is: Whom did Umm Kulthūm marry finally? In answer to this question, we must say that it was clarified earlier that, based on the saying of Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a), he had kept his daughters for the sons of his brother, Ja‘far. In fact, this was done by the order of the Messenger of Allah (s) because one day the holy Prophet (s) looked at Ali’s and Ja‘far’s children whereupon the Prophet (s) said:

"بناتنا لبنينا وبنونا لبناتنا"

*“Our daughters are for our sons and our sons are for our daughters”.*<sup>2</sup>

However, when it comes to Umm Kulthūm, there is a narration which says: “‘Umar asked Ali for Umm Kulthūm’s hand in marriage. Ali made the excuse that she was too young and he further said that he had kept her for the son of his brother, Ja‘far...”<sup>3</sup>

Likewise, it is seen in this narration that the Imam (a) did not specify which son of Ja‘far he had kept his daughter for, but we know that he meant either ‘Awn or Muḥammad. This is

<sup>1</sup> *Mukhtaṣar Tārīkh Dimashq*, 6/205.

<sup>2</sup> *Man lā Yahḍuruḥu al-Faqīh*, 3/249 tradition number 1184.

<sup>3</sup> *Dhakhā’ir al-‘Uqba*, 288; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 13/269 tradition number 37586.



because, as mentioned earlier, the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) had married his daughter Zaynab (a) to ‘Abdullah, who was the eldest of his brothers.

Among the Sunni scholars, whose opinions and reports we are discussing in this book, there is no difference as to the fact that ‘Awn was killed in the battle of Shushtar, during the reign of ‘Umar’s caliphate. Hence, based on the aforementioned narrations which we assume to be authentic, Umm Kulthūm was married to ‘Umar during this time.

When it comes to Muḥammad, b. Ja‘far, Ibn Ḥajar comments as such: “Abū ‘Umar has narrated from al-Wāqidī that Muḥammad’s nickname was Abul Qāsim. He married Umm Kulthūm after ‘Umar’s death.” He further says: “Muḥammad was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.”

It has been said that Muḥammad lived until the time of Imam Ali (a) and was in the company of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a) during the battle of Ṣiffin.

In his *al-Ikhwa*, Dār Quṭnī writes: “It is said that Muḥammad was martyred in the battle of Ṣiffin. In this battle, he fought with ‘Ubaydullah b. ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb and they fought each other to their death.”

In this respect, Marzbanī too writes in *Mu‘jam al-Shu‘arā*: “Muḥammad b. Ja‘far and Muḥammad b. Abī Bakr were in Egypt. When Muḥammad b. Abī Bakr was killed, Muḥammad went into hiding. A person from the clan of ‘Ak and the tribe of Ghāfiq advised him to leave Egypt and he fled there for Palestine where he went to one of his maternal uncles from Khath‘am clan. He saved Muḥammad from Mu‘āwiyya's mischief. Later on, Muḥammad composed a poem describing this incident.”

He further writes: “This has been proven and it rejects al-Wāqidi who said that Muḥammad was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.”<sup>1</sup>

So, the person who married Umm Kulthūm, after ‘Umar’s death, based on the foregoing supposition, is Muḥammad b. Ja‘far and, as was stated earlier, Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr has confirmed this. Concerning ‘Abdullah too, it is necessary to know that he is likely to have married Umm Kulthūm after the death of his wife Zaynab (a). That is because according to Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr, ‘Abdullah was alive until the year 80 of the Islamic lunar calendar and he lived for ninety years.

### Summary of the Book

The discussion was about Umm Kulthūm’s marriage to ‘Umar. The story was narrated from the most famous books authored by Sunni scholars. In this study, we unveiled the most hidden aspects of the story carefully examining the chains of the narrations, their significations, the narrators and their goals. The truth of the matter was explained and substantiated and the controversies came to an end.

Assuming that Hazrat Zahrā (a) had a daughter by the name of Umm Kulthūm and that marriage in Islam takes place only when the formula of marriage contract is recited, therefore, based on the few narrations mentioned in al-Kulaynī’s *al-Kāfi*, we can conclude that:

‘Umar asked Ali (a) for Umm Kulthūm’s hand in marriage and the Imam (a) made the excuse that she was too young and that she was engaged to her cousin. After ‘Umar’s repeated proposal, frequenting and resorting to threat to intimidate the Commander of the Faithful, (a) and Bani Hāshim, the Imam left the matter to be decided by his uncle ‘Abbās; the marriage took place in the sense that only a

---

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Iṣṣabah*, 6/7.

marriage contract was concluded without Ali (a) and his daughter consenting to it.

That was why no sooner 'Umar died than Ali (a) returned his daughter to his house. Hence, what has been narrated in some Sunni books about the girl dressing up and going to 'Umar under the pretext of handing over a piece of garment is baseless and undocumented scientifically. The same is the case with the report about Umm Kulthūm's death occurring simultaneously with the death of her child from 'Umar.

The conclusion is that this incident cannot be used to cover up 'Umar's conduct towards the household of the Prophet (s) during Lady Zahrā's lifetime. Likewise, they cannot use this story to argue that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him, was in good and friendly terms with 'Umar.

## Bibliography

1. *Iḥyā' Ulūm al-Dīn*, Abū Hāmid al-Ghazzali, Dār al-Ma'rifa, Beirut, Lebanon.
2. *Al-Istī'āb*, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.
3. *Usd al-Ghabah*, Ibn Athīr, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon.
4. *Al-Iṣābah*, Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.
5. *Iḥṣām al-A'dā' wa al-Khusum*, Allama Sayed Nasir al-Ḥusayn Musavi Hindi, New Naynaw Library.
6. *Al-Ansab*, *Sam'ānī*, Dār al-Fikr Publications, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1408 AH.
7. *Behar al-Anwar*, Muḥammad Baqir Majlisi, Dār al-Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1403 AH.
8. *Tārīkh Baghdad*, Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1417 AH.
9. *Tārīkh al-Khamis*, Diyar Bakri, Dār Sader Publication's, Lebanon.
10. *Tārīkh al-al-Ṭabarī*, al-Ṭabarī, Urumiyya Bookstall Publications, Qom, Iran
11. *Tazkirat al-Khawwas*, Sibṭ b. Jawzi, Ahlul-Bayt (a) Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, 1401 AH.
12. *Taqrib al-Tahzib*, Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1415 AH.

13. *Talkhis al-Mustadrak*, al-Dhahabī, Dār al-Ma'rifa, Beirut, Lebanon.
14. *Tahzib al-Asma wa al-Lughat*, al-Nawawī, Dār al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1416.
15. *Tahzib al-Tahzib*, Ibn Ḥajar al-al-'Asqalānī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.
16. *Husn al-Muḥaḍara*, al-Suyūṭī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.
17. *Hilyat al-Awlia*, Abū Naīm al-Iṣfahānī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.
18. *Dhakahir al-Uqba*, Muhibbuddin al-Ṭabarī, al-Sahabah Library, Jeddah, al-Sharqiyah, al-Tabe'ein Library, Cairo, first edition, 1415 AH.
19. *Al-Durriat al-Tahira*, Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Anṣārī, Razi al-Dūlābī, researched by Sayed Muḥammad Jawad Husseini Jalali, Islamic Publications Institute, Qom, Iran, 1407 AH.
20. *Silk al-Durar fī A'yan al-Qar al-Thani Ashar*, Muradi, al-Muthanna Library, Baghdad Iraq.
21. *Sunan Abī Dawood, Abī Dawood*, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1416 AH.
22. *Al-Sunan al-Kubra*, al-Bayhaqī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1414 AH.
23. *Sunan al-Al-Nasā'ī*, Al-Nasā'ī, with annotation by al-Suyūṭī and Marginal Notes by Sindi, Dār al-Ma'rifa, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1414 AH.
24. *Sharḥ al-Mawāhib al-Laduniyya*, al-Qastalānī, Dār al-Ma'rifa, Beirut, Lebanon, 1414 AH.
25. *Al-Ḍu'afā al-Kabir*, Uqaili, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon.
26. *Ṭabaqāt al-Huffadh*, al-Suyūṭī, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1414 AH.
27. *Al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubra*, Ibn Sa'd, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1418 AH.
28. *Ghayat al-Nehayah fī Ṭabaqāt al-Qura*, Jazari Shafe'i, Khanji Library, Egypt, 1351 AH.

29. *Faidh al-Qadīr, Manawī*, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.
30. *Al-Kāshif, al-Dhahabī*, Dār al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.
31. *Al-Kāfī*, Muḥammad b. Yaʿqūb Kulayani, Dār Saʿb, Dār al-Taʾaruf Publication's, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1401 AH.
32. *Al-Kāmil*, Ibn Athīr, Dār al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1399.
33. *Al-Kāmil fī Dhu'afā al-Rijāl*, Ibn ʿAdī, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, Beirut, first edition, 1418 AH.
34. *Kitāb al-Majruḥīn*, Ibn Ḥibbān, Dār al-Maʿrifah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1412 AH.
35. *Kanzul ʿUmmal*, Al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1419 AH.
36. *Lisan al-Arab*, Ibn Madhur Afriqi, Beirut, Lebanon.
37. *Turāthuna Magazine*, Aalulbayt (a) Institute for Reviving (Islamic) Legacy, Qom, Iran.
38. *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʿid wa Manbaʿ al-Fawāʿid*, al-Haythamī, Dār al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1412.
39. *Mukhtasar Tārīkh Dimashq*, Ibn Mandhur, Dār al-Fikr, Syria, Damascus, first edition, 1404 AH.
40. *Merʿat al-Jenan*, Yafeʿei, Dār al-Kutub al-Islamiyah, Cairo, Egypt, second edition, 1413.
41. *al-Mustadrak*, Hākim al-Nīshābūrī, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1411 AH.
42. *Musnad Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal*, Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, Dār Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1415 AH.
43. *al-Maʿaref*, Ibn Qutayba, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1407 AH.
44. *Maʿrefat al-Sahabah*, Abū Naʿīm al-Iṣfahānī, Beirut, Lebanon.
45. *al-Mughni fī al-Ḍuʿafā*, al-Dhahabī, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.
46. *al-Manqib*, Ibn Maghāzalī, Dār al-Adhwa, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1214 AH.
47. *Man La Yahdhuru al-Faqih*, Shaykh Saduq, Dār Saʿb, Dār al-Taʾaruf, Beirut, Lebanon, 1401 AH.

48. *Mizān al-ʿItidāl, al-Dhahabī*, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1416.
49. *Wasā'il al-Shi'ah*, Shaykh Ḥurr ʿĀmili, Dār Ihya al-Turath al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, fifth edition, 1403 AH.